Evidence Portfolio – Chronic Conditions Subcommittee, Question 2

In individuals with osteoarthritis, what is the relationship between physical activity and (1) risk of co-morbid conditions, (2) physical function, (3) health-related quality of life, (4) disease progression, and (5) pain?

- a. Is there a dose-response relationship? If yes, what is the shape of the relationship?
- b. Does the relationship vary by age, sex, race/ethnicity, socio-economic status, or weight status?
- c. Does the relationship vary based on: frequency, duration, intensity, type (mode), or how physical activity is measured?

Sources of Evidence: Original Research, Existing Systematic Review, and Existing Meta-Analyses

Conclusion Statements and Grades

RISK OF CO-MORBID CONDITIONS

Insufficient evidence is available to determine whether a relationship exists between greater amounts of physical activity and comorbidities in individuals with osteoarthritis. **PAGAC Grade: Not assignable.**

PHYSICAL FUNCTION OR PAIN

Strong evidence demonstrates a relationship between greater amounts of physical activity with decreased pain and improved physical function in adults with osteoarthritis of the knee and hip. **PAGAC Grade: Strong**.

Insufficient evidence is available to determine whether a dose-response relationship exists between physical activity with pain or physical function in individuals with osteoarthritis. **PAGAC Grade: Not assignable.**

Insufficient evidence is available to determine whether the relationship between physical activity with pain or physical function varies by age, sex, race/ethnicity, socioeconomic status, or body weight status in individuals with osteoarthritis. **PAGAC Grade: Not assignable**.

Limited evidence suggests that greater intensity or duration of aerobic and muscle-strengthening physical activity is related to improvement in pain and physical function in individuals with osteoarthritis of the knee and hip. **PAGAC Grade: Limited.**

HEALTH-RELATED QUALITY OF LIFE

Moderate evidence indicates a relationship between greater amounts of physical activity and improved health-related quality of life in individuals with osteoarthritis of the knee and hip. **PAGAC Grade: Moderate.**

Insufficient evidence is available to determine whether a dose-response relationship exists between physical activity and health-related quality of life in individuals with osteoarthritis. **PAGAC Grade: Not assignable.**

Insufficient evidence is available to determine whether the relationship between physical activity and health-related quality of life varies by age, sex, race/ethnicity, socioeconomic status, or body weight status in individuals with osteoarthritis. **PAGAC Grade: Not assignable**.

Insufficient evidence is available to determine whether the frequency, duration, intensity, or type (mode) of physical activity is related to health-related quality of life in individuals with osteoarthritis. **PAGAC Grade: Not assignable.**

DISEASE PROGRESSION

Moderate evidence indicates a relationship between physical activity and disease progression in individuals with osteoarthritis. Moderate evidence indicates that up to the range of 10,000 steps per day, ambulatory physical activity does not accelerate osteoarthritis of the knee. **PAGAC Grade: Moderate.**

Moderate evidence indicates a dose-response relationship between physical activity and disease progression in individuals with osteoarthritis. The relationship appears to be U-shaped. **PAGAC Grade: Moderate.**

Insufficient evidence is available to determine whether the relationship between physical activity and progression varies by age, sex, race/ethnicity, socioeconomic status, or body weight status in individuals with osteoarthritis. **PAGAC Grade: Not assignable**.

Insufficient evidence is available to determine whether the frequency, duration, intensity, or type (mode) of physical activity is related to progression in individuals with osteoarthritis. **PAGAC Grade: Not** assignable.

Description of the Evidence

An initial search for systematic reviews, meta-analyses, pooled analyses, and reports identified sufficient literature to answer four of the five health outcomes in the research question. The initial search for systematic reviews, meta-analyses, pooled analyses, and reports did not identify sufficient literature to answer the disease progression health outcome in the research question as determined by the Chronic Conditions Subcommittee. A supplementary search for original research was conducted to capture literature related to the disease progression health outcome.

PAIN

Existing Meta-Analyses

Overview

A total of 5 meta-analyses were included.¹⁻⁵ The reviews were published between 2014 and 2016 and included a range of 11 to 54 studies. The meta-analyses covered an extensive timeframe: inception to 2012,⁵ inception to 2013,⁴ inception to 2014,² and 1945 to April 2015.¹ Chang et al³ did not report on the search timeframe.

Exposures

The meta-analyses examined a variety of physical activity interventions, including land-based therapeutic strength and aerobic exercises, $^{2.4}$ aquatic activities, $^{1.2}$ and tai chi. $^{3.4}$ Juhl et al⁵ examined single exercises or a combination of exercises, including aerobic, resistance, and performance training.

Outcomes

The included reviews¹⁻⁵ addressed pain as an outcome using a variety of scales (e.g., Western Ontario and McMaster's Osteoarthritis Index, Lequesne Osteoarthritis Index).

PHYSICAL FUNCTION

Existing Meta-Analyses

Overview

A total of 5 meta-analyses were included.^{1, 3-6} These reviews were published between 2011 and 2016 and included a range of 11 to 54 studies. The meta-analyses covered an extensive timeframe: inception to 2010,⁶ inception to 2012,⁵ inception to 2013,⁴ and 1945 to April 2015.¹ Chang et al³ did not report on the search timeframe.

Exposures

The meta-analyses examined a variety of physical activity interventions, including land-based strength and aerobic exercises, $\frac{4}{6}$ aquatic activities, $\frac{1}{2}$, $\frac{6}{2}$ and tai chi. $\frac{3}{4}$, $\frac{4}{6}$ Juhl et al⁵ examined single exercises or a combination of exercises, including aerobic, resistance, and performance training.

Outcomes

The included reviews addressed physical function outcomes in a variety of ways, including perceived self-efficacy and cognitive and emotional impairment³; functional aerobic capacity³, ⁶; and disability and physical function measured using the Activities of Daily Living Scale, Western Ontario and McMaster's Osteoarthritis Index, or Global Disability Scores, among other tools.¹, ⁴, ⁵

HEALTH-RELATED QUALITY OF LIFE

Existing Meta-Analyses

Overview

A total of 2 meta-analyses were included.^{1, $\frac{1}{2}$} The reviews were published in 2015 and 2016 and included a range of 13–54 studies. The 2 meta-analyses covered an extensive timeframe: from inception to 2013⁴ and from 1945 to April 2015.¹

Exposures

<u>Fransen et al</u>⁴ examined a variety of land-based therapeutic exercises, including muscle strengthening, balance training, aerobic walking, cycling, and tai chi. <u>Bartels et al</u>¹ assessed various types of exercises (e.g., range of motion, strength, aerobics) performed in a therapeutic or heated indoor pool.

Outcomes

The included reviews addressed health-related quality of life as an outcome using a variety of scales.^{1,4}

DISEASE PROGRESSION

Existing Systematic Review and Meta-Analysis

Overview

A total of 2 existing reviews were included: 1 systematic review² and 1 meta-analysis.⁸ The reviews were published in 2015 and 2016. The systematic review² included 49 studies published from inception to 2013. The meta-analysis included 3 studies published from inception to 2015.

Exposures

The meta-analysis⁸ assessed self-reported running or jogging (including running-related sports such as triathlon and orienteering). The studies included in the systematic review² used low-impact therapeutic physical activity combining strengthening, stretching, and aerobic elements.

Outcomes

<u>Timmins et al</u>⁸ used radiography, imaging, and questionnaires to examine diagnosis of knee osteoarthritis, radiographic markers of knee osteoarthritis, knee joint surgery for osteoarthritis, knee pain, and knee-associated disability. <u>Quicke et al</u>⁷ assessed structural osteoarthritis imaging progression or progression to total knee replacement as outcomes.

Original Research

Overview

A total of 5 original research studies that examined the relationship between physical activity and disease progression were included as sources of evidence.⁹⁻¹³ All studies were prospective cohorts and were published from 2013 to 2016.

The analytical sample size ranged from 100^{11} to 2,073.¹⁰ Of the 4 studies that reported location, 3 were conducted in the United States^{10, 12, 13} and 1 was conducted in Tasmania.⁹

Exposure

The included studies examined self-reported¹⁰⁻¹² physical activity using the Physical Activity Scale for the Elderly (PASE), and measured steps objectively via accelerometer or pedometer.^{9, 13}

Outcomes

All included studies examined osteoarthritis progression (e.g., knee structural change, cartilage loss) as the outcome.

Populations Analyzed

The table below lists the populations analyzed in each article.

Table 1. Populations Analyzed by All Sources of Evidence

	Age	Chronic Conditions	Other
Bartels, 2016	Older adults	Osteoarthritis	
Beumer, 2016	Adults	Osteoarthritis	
Chang, 2016	Adults	Osteoarthritis	
Dore, 2013	Age 50-80	Subjects with and without pre-existing knee abnormalities (56–58% with knee osteoarthritis)	
Escalante, 2011	Adults	Osteoarthritis	
Felson, 2013	Mean 61	With or at high risk of knee osteoarthritis	
Fransen, 2015	Adults	Osteoarthritis	
Juhl, 2014	52.2–73.8	Osteoarthritis	
Kwee, 2016	45–79	Osteoarthritis	
Lin, 2013	45–60		
Oiestad, 2015	50–79	Subjects at high risk or with osteoarthritis diagnosis (Kellgren and Lawrence grades <3)	
Quicke, 2016	Mean age >45	Osteoarthritis	Knee pain
Timmins, 2016	Adults	Osteoarthritis	

Existing Systematic Review and Meta-Analyses

Table 2. Existing Systematic Review and Meta-Analyses Individual Evidence Summary Tables

Pain, Physical Function, and Health-Related Quality of Life				
Meta-Analysis				
Citation: Bartels EM, Juhl CB, Christensen R, et al. Aquatic exercise for the treatment of knee and hip				
osteoarthritis. Cochrane Database Syst Rev. March 2016:Cd005523.				
doi:10.1002/14651858.CD005523.pub3.				
Purpose: To evaluate	Abstract: BACKGROUND: Osteoarthritis is a chronic disease characterized by			
the effects of aquatic	joint pain, tenderness, and limitation of movement. At present, no cure is			
exercise for people	available. Thus only treatment of the person's symptoms and treatment to			
with knee or hip	prevent further development of the disease are possible. Clinical trials			
osteoarthritis, or both,	indicate that aquatic exercise may have advantages for people with			
compared to no	osteoarthritis. This is an update of a published Cochrane review.			
intervention.	OBJECTIVES: To evaluate the effects of aquatic exercise for people with knee			
Timeframe: 1945–	or hip osteoarthritis, or both, compared to no intervention. SEARCH			
April 2015	METHODS: We searched the following databases up to 28 April 2015: the			
Total # of Studies: 13	Cochrane Central Register of Controlled Trials (CENTRAL; the Cochrane			
Exposure Definition:	Library Issue 1, 2014), MEDLINE (from 1949), EMBASE (from 1980), CINAHL			
All types of exercises	(from 1982), PEDro (Physiotherapy Evidence Database), and Web of Science			
(e.g., range of motion,	(from 1945). There was no language restriction. SELECTION CRITERIA:			
strength, aerobics)	Randomized controlled clinical trials of aquatic exercise compared to a			
performed in a	control group (e.g. usual care, education, social attention, telephone call,			
therapeutic/heated	waiting list for surgery) of participants with knee or hip osteoarthritis. DATA			
indoor pool. The mean	COLLECTION AND ANALYSIS: Two review authors independently selected			
length of the	trials for inclusion, extracted data and assessed risk of bias of the included			
interventions was 12	trials. We analysed the pooled results using standardized mean difference			
weeks (range 6–20	(SMD) values. MAIN RESULTS: Nine new trials met the inclusion criteria and			
weeks).	we excluded two earlier included trials. Thus the number of participants			
Measures Steps: No	increased from 800 to 1190 and the number of included trials increased			
Measures Bouts: No	from six to 13. Most participants were female (75%), with an average age of			
Examines HIIT: No	68 years and a body mass index (BMI) of 29.4. Osteoarthritis duration was			
Outcomes Addressed:	6.7 years, with a great variation of the included participants. The mean			
Pain, disability, quality	aquatic exercise duration was 12 weeks. We found 12 trials at low to unclear			
of life: measurement	risk of bias for all domains except blinding of participants and personnel.			
tools, e.g., Activities of	They showed that aquatic exercise caused a small short term improvement			
Daily Living Scale,	compared to control in pain (SMD -0.31, 95% CI -0.47 to -0.15; 12 trials, 1076			
visual analog scale,	participants) and disability (SMD -0.32, 95% CI -0.47 to -0.17; 12 trials, 1059			
short form health	participants). Ten trials showed a small effect on quality of life (QoL) (SMD -			
survey (SF 36/12/8),	0.25, 95% CI -0.49 to -0.01; 10 trials, 971 participants). These effects on pain			
Western Ontario and	and disability correspond to a five point lower (95% CI three to eight points			
McMaster Universities	lower) score on mean pain and mean disability compared to the control			
Arthritis Index	group (scale 0 to 100), and a seven point higher (95% Cl 0 to 13 points			
(WOMAC) physical	higher) score on mean QoL compared with control group (scale 0 to 100). No			
function subscale with	included trials performed a radiographic evaluation. No serious adverse			
a scale of 0–100.	events were reported in the included trials with relation to aquatic exercise.			
	AUTHORS' CONCLUSIONS: There is moderate quality evidence that aquatic			

Examine	exercise may have small, short-term, and clinically relevant effects on
Cardiorespiratory	patient-reported pain, disability, and QoL in people with knee and hip OA.
Fitness as Outcome:	The conclusions of this review update does not change those of the previous
No	published version of this Cochrane review.
Populations Analyzed:	Author-Stated Funding Source: The Oak Foundation.
Older adults,	
Osteoarthritis	

Meta-Analysis

Citation: Beumer L, Wong J, Warden SJ, Kemp JL, Foster P, Crossley KM. Effects of exercise and manual therapy on pain associated with hip osteoarthritis: a systematic review and meta-analysis. *Br J Sports Med.* 2016;50(8):458–463. doi:10.1136/bjsports-2015-095255.

Pain

Purpose: To examine the short-	Abstract: AIM: To explore the effects of exercise (water-based
term, medium-term, and long-term	or land-based) and/or manual therapies on pain in adults with
efficacy of land-based and water-	clinically and/or radiographically diagnosed hip osteoarthritis
based exercise therapies and	(OA). METHODS: A systematic review and meta-analysis was
manual therapies in the reduction	performed, with patient reported pain assessed using a visual
of pain in patients with hip	analogue scale (VAS) or the Western Ontario and McMaster
osteoarthritis.	Universities Arthritis Index (WOMAC) pain subscale. Data were
Timeframe: Inception–July 2014	grouped by follow-up time (0-3 months=short term; 4-12
Total # of Studies: 19	months=medium term and; >12 months=long term), and
Exposure Definition: Exercise or	standardised mean differences (SMD) with 95% CIs were used
manual therapies. Exercise	to establish intervention effect sizes. Study quality was
therapies were either land or water	assessed using modified PEDro scores. RESULTS: 19 trials were
based. Intervention durations were	included. Four studies showed short-term benefits favouring
<3 months, 4–12 months, and >12	water-based exercise over minimal control using the WOMAC
months. Study and intervention	pain subscale (SMD -0.53, 95% CI -0.96 to -0.10). Six studies
characteristics were included in 2	supported a short-term benefit of land-based exercise
appendices.	compared to minimal control on VAS assessed pain (SMD -0.49,
Measures Steps: No	95% Cl -0.70 to -0.29). There were no medium (SMD -0.23, 95%
Measures Bouts: No	CI -0.48 to 0.03) or long (SMD -0.22, 95% CI -0.51 to 0.06) term
Examines HIIT: No	benefits of exercise therapy, or benefit of combining exercise
Outcomes Addressed: Pain:	therapy with manual therapy (SMD -0.38, 95% CI -0.88 to 0.13)
patient-reported, assessed using a	when compared to minimal control. CONCLUSIONS: Best
visual analogue scale (VAS) or the	available evidence indicates that exercise therapy (whether
Western Ontario and McMaster	land-based or water-based) is more effective than minimal
Universities Arthritis Index	control in managing pain associated with hip OA in the short
(WOMAC) pain subscale.	term. Larger high-quality RCTs are needed to establish the
Examine Cardiorespiratory Fitness	effectiveness of exercise and manual therapies in the medium
as Outcome: No	and long term.
Populations Analyzed: Adults,	Author-Stated Funding Source: No funding source used.
Osteoarthritis	

Pain and Physical Function

Meta-Analysis

Citation: Chang WD, Chen S, Lee CL, Lin HY, Lai PT. The effects of tai chi chuan on improving mindbody health for knee osteoarthritis patients: a systematic review and meta-analysis. *Evid Based Complement Alternat Med*. July 2016:1813979. doi:10.1155/2016/1813979.

Purpose: To conduct a meta-analysis and	Abstract: Purpose. To conduct a meta-analysis and
systematic review examining whether tai chi	systematic review examining whether Tai Chi Chuan
chuan could have mental and physical	could have mental and physical benefits for patients
benefits for patients with knee osteoarthritis.	with knee osteoarthritis. Methods. MEDLINE,
Timeframe: Not reported	PUBMED, EMBASE, and CINAHL databases were
Total # of Studies: 11	searched for relevant studies. Data of the studies
Exposure Definition: Tai chi chuan was the	were collected, and outcomes were classified using
primary intervention exercise; 12–31	the International Classification of Functioning,
movements of Sun-style form and 10–24	Disability, and Health model. Effect sizes of the
movements of Yang-style form were	mental and physical components were determined,
adopted, and 40- to 65-minute training	along with the recommendation grades of
sessions of tai chi chuan class were	Philadelphia Panel Classification System for Tai Chi
conducted 1–4 times each week for 6–24	Chuan on knee osteoarthritis. Results. Eleven studies
weeks.	were selected and retrieved from the databases. The
Measures Steps: No	results of meta-analysis revealed that the effects of
Measures Bouts: No	Tai Chi Chuan were observed for physical components
Examines HIIT: No	in the body functions and structures domain. The
Outcomes Addressed: Perceived self-	effects favoring Tai Chi Chuan were observed in the
efficacy, benefits, barriers, and emotional	physical component in the activities and participation
salience: 28-item motivation scale for health	domain. Insufficient data was included in the meta-
behaviors. Cognitive and emotional	analysis of the mental component. Conclusions. The
impairment: 60-point Center for	review revealed that Tai Chi Chuan had beneficial
Epidemiologic Studies Depression Index and	outcomes for patients with knee osteoarthritis. The
30-point mini-mental state examination.	evidence-based results represented that it had small-
Severity of pain during knee movement: 10-	to-moderate effects on body functions and
point visual analog scale and 35-point knee	structures, activities, and participation of physical
pain scale of Western Ontario and McMaster	component. However, there was insufficient evidence
Universities Osteoarthritis Index (WOMAC).	to support that Tai Chi Chuan had beneficial mental
Knee muscle strength, endurance, and range	effect.
of motion: isokinetic dynamometer and a	
goniometer. Cardiovascular functioning: 6-	
minute walk test, stair climb test, sit-to-stand	
test, and Timed Up and Go test.	
Examine Cardiorespiratory Fitness as	
Outcome: Yes	
Populations Analyzed: Adults, Osteoarthritis	Author-Stated Funding Source: China Medical
	University.

Physical Function				
Meta-Analysis				
Citation: Escalante Y, Garcia-Hermoso A, Saavedra JM. Effects of exercise on functional aerobic				
capacity in lower limb osteoarthritis: a systematic review. J Sci Med Sport. 2011;14(3):190–198.				
doi:10.1016/j.jsams.2010.10.	004.			
Purpose: To summarize	Abstract: Osteoarthritis (OA) is a degenerative joint disease. The			
evidence for the	reduced aerobic capacity of patients with lower limb osteoarthritis			
effectiveness and structure	affects their independence in performing everyday activities. The			
of exercise programs on	purpose of this systematic review was to summarize evidence for the			
functional aerobic capacity	effectiveness and structure of exercise programs on functional aerobic			
in patients with hip and	capacity (ability to perform activities of daily living that require			
knee osteoarthritis.	sustained aerobic metabolism) in patients with hip and knee			
Timeframe: Inception-	osteoarthritis. A computerized search was made of seven databases.			
August 2010	Effect sizes (ES) and 95% confidence intervals (CI) were calculated, and			
Total # of Studies: 20	the heterogeneity of the studies was assessed using Cochran's Q			
Exposure Definition:	statistic applied to the ES means. The 20 studies that satisfied the			
Physical exercise, including	inclusion criteria were selected for analysis. These studies were			
land exercise (strength, tai	grouped into five categories according to the characteristics of the			
chi, aerobic, mixed	exercise program: land-based interventions (strength programs, tai chi,			
programs) and aquatic	aerobic programs, mixed exercise programs) and aquatic intervention			
interventions; minimum	(hydrotherapy). The functional aerobic capacity improved in tai chi			
program duration of 4	programs (ES=0.66; 95% Cl, 0.23-1.09), aerobic programs (ES=0.90; 95%			
weeks.	CI, 0.70-1.10), and mixed programs (ES=0.47; 95% CI, -0.38-0.39). The			
Measures Steps: No	conclusions were: (i) despite recommendations for the use of exercise			
Measures Bouts: No	programs for aerobic fitness in patients with hip and knee			
Examines HIIT: No	osteoarthritis, few randomized clinical trials have been conducted; (ii)			
Outcomes Addressed:	the structure of the exercise programs (program content and duration,			
Aerobic capacity: 6-minute	and session frequency and duration) is very heterogeneous; (iii) overall,			
walk test.	exercise programs based on tai chi, aerobic, and mixed exercise seem			
Examine Cardiorespiratory	to give better results than hydrotherapy programs, but without the			
Fitness as Outcome: No	differences being altogether clear.			
Populations Analyzed:	Author-Stated Funding Source: Ministry of Education; Social European			
Adults, Osteoarthritis	Funds and the Autonomous Government of Extremadura.			

Pain, Physical Function, and Health-Related Quality of Life

Meta-Analysis

Citation: Fransen M, McConnell S, Harmer AR, Van der Esch M, Simic M, Bennell KL. Exercise for osteoarthritis of the knee: a Cochrane systematic review. *Br J Sports Med*. 2015;49(24):1554–1557. doi:10.1136/bjsports-2015-095424.

Purpose: To determine whether land-	Abstract: OBJECTIVE: To determine whether land-based
based therapeutic exercise is beneficial	therapeutic exercise is beneficial for people with knee
for people with knee osteoarthritis in	osteoarthritis (OA) in terms of reduced joint pain or
terms of reduced joint pain or improved	improved physical function and quality of life. METHODS:
physical function and quality of life.	Five electronic databases were searched, up until May
Timeframe: Inception–May 2013	2013. Randomised clinical trials comparing some form of
Total # of Studies: 54	land-based therapeutic exercise with a non-exercise
Exposure Definition: Land-based	control were selected. Three teams of two review authors
therapeutic exercises, which varied	independently extracted data and assessed risk of bias for
widely in the type, location, frequency,	each study. Standardised mean differences immediately
duration, and intensity of exercise.	after treatment and 2-6 months after cessation of formal
Examples of exercise programs include	treatment were separately pooled using a random effects
a multimodal intervention with manual	model. RESULTS: In total, 54 studies were identified.
therapy, upper limb and trunk muscle	Overall, 19 (35%) studies reported adequate random
strengthening, and balance training.	sequence generation, allocation concealment and
Aerobic walking, cycling, and tai chi	adequately accounted for incomplete outcome data.
were also used as interventions, which	However, research results may be vulnerable to selection,
ranged from 1 day per week to 5 days	attrition and detection bias. Pooled results from 44 trials
per week. Sessions lasted 20–60	indicated that exercise significantly reduced pain (12
minutes.	points/100; 95% CI 10 to 15) and improved physical
Measures Steps: No	function (10 points/100; 95% Cl 8 to 13) to a moderate
Measures Bouts: No	degree immediately after treatment, while evidence from
Examines HIIT: No	13 studies revealed that exercise significantly improved
Outcomes Addressed: Pain, physical	quality of life immediately after treatment with small effect
function, quality of life: Scales (e.g.,	(4 points/100; 95% Cl 2 to 5). In addition, 12 studies
Western Ontario and McMaster	provided 2-month to 6-month post-treatment
Universities Osteoarthritis Index	sustainability data which showed significantly reduced
[WOMAC], global disability scores,	knee pain (6 points/100; 95% CI 3 to 9) and 10 studies
global pain scores, Short Form 36,	which showed improved physical function (3 points/100;
sickness impact profile, or Lequesne	95% CI 1 to 5). CONCLUSIONS: Among people with knee
Osteroarthritis Index).	osteoarthritis, land-based therapeutic exercise provides
Examine Cardiorespiratory Fitness as	short-term benefit that is sustained for at least 2-6 months
Outcome: No	after cessation of formal treatment.
Populations Analyzed: Adults,	Author-Stated Funding Source: National Health and
Osteoarthritis	Medical Research Council, Australia.

Pain and Physical Function

Meta-Analysis

Citation: Juhl C, Christensen R, Roos EM, Zhang W, Lund H. Impact of exercise type and dose on pain and disability in knee osteoarthritis: a systematic review and meta-regression analysis of randomized controlled trials. *Arthritis Rheumatol*. 2014;66(3):622–636. doi:10.1002/art.38290.

Purpose: To analyze the effect of	Abstract: OBJECTIVE: To identify the optimal exercise program,
exercise therapy interventions in	characterized by type and intensity of exercise, length of
order to identify the optimal	program, duration of individual supervised sessions, and
exercise program for reducing pain	number of sessions per week, for reducing pain and patient-
and disability in knee	reported disability in knee osteoarthritis (OA). METHODS: A
osteoarthritis among adults.	systematic review and meta-analysis of randomized controlled
Timeframe: Inception–May 2012	trials were performed. Standardized mean differences (SMDs)
Total # of Studies: 48	were combined using a random-effects model. Study-level
Exposure Definition: Exercise	covariates were applied in meta-regression analyses in order to
programs classified as a single type	reduce between-study heterogeneity. RESULTS: Forty-eight
of exercise (at least 75% of the	trials were included. Similar effects in reducing pain were found
exercise session, including warm-	for aerobic, resistance, and performance exercise (SMD 0.67,
up and cooldown, involved one	0.62, and 0.48, respectively; P = 0.733). These single-type
type of exercise) or as consisting	exercise programs were more efficacious than programs that
of a combination of different types	included different exercise types (SMD 0.61 versus 0.16; P <
of exercise (several types of	0.001). The effect of aerobic exercise on pain relief increased
exercise with different aims were	with an increased number of supervised sessions (slope 0.022
performed within the same	[95% confidence interval 0.002, 0.043]). More pain reduction
session). Stratified analysis by type	occurred with quadriceps-specific exercise than with lower limb
(aerobic, resistance, or	exercise (SMD 0.85 versus 0.39; P = 0.005) and when supervised
performance) and amount of	exercise was performed at least 3 times a week (SMD 0.68
exercise (low: up to 12 sessions,	versus 0.41; P = 0.017). No impact of intensity, duration of
intermediate: 13–24, large: >25	individual sessions, or patient characteristics was found. Similar
sessions).	results were found for the effect on patient-reported disability.
Measures Steps: No	CONCLUSION: Optimal exercise programs for knee OA should
Measures Bouts: No	have one aim and focus on improving aerobic capacity,
Examines HIIT: No	quadriceps muscle strength, or lower extremity performance.
Outcomes Addressed: Pain.	For best results, the program should be supervised and carried
Disability.	out 3 times a week. Such programs have a similar effect
Examine Cardiorespiratory Fitness	regardless of patient characteristics, including radiographic
as Outcome: No	severity and baseline pain.
Populations Analyzed: Ages 52.2–	Author-Stated Funding Source: Health Insurance Foundation;
73.8, Osteoarthritis	Danish Physiotherapy Association; Oak Foundation.

Progression

Systematic Review

Citation: Quicke JG, Foster NE, Thomas MJ, Holden MA. Is long-term physical activity safe for older adults with knee pain? A systematic review. *Osteoarthritis Cartilage*. 2015;23(9):1445–1456. doi:10.1016/j.joca.2015.05.002.

Purpose: To synthesize existing	Abstract: OBJECTIVE: To determine whether long-term
literature from multiple safety-related	physical activity is safe for older adults with knee pain.
outcome domains to determine	DESIGN: A comprehensive systematic review and narrative
whether long-term PA is safe for older	synthesis of existing literature was conducted using multiple
adults with knee pain.	electronic databases from inception until May 2013. Two
Timeframe: Inception–May 2013	reviewers independently screened, checked data extraction
Total # of Studies: 49	and carried out quality assessment. Inclusion criteria for
Exposure Definition: PA type,	study designs were randomised controlled trials (RCTs),
intensity, and duration varied widely.	prospective cohort studies or case control studies, which
All of the randomized controlled trials	included adults of mean age over 45 years old with knee
investigated therapeutic exercise PA	pain or osteoarthritis (OA), undertaking physical activity
and were considered low impact.	over at least 3 months and which measured a safety related
"Mixed" exercise interventions	outcome (adverse events, pain, physical functioning,
combining strengthening, stretching,	structural OA imaging progression or progression to total
and aerobic elements were most	knee replacement (TKR)). RESULTS: Of the 8614 unique
common. Duration ranged from 3	references identified, 49 studies were included in the
months to 30 months, and frequency	review, comprising 48 RCTs and one case control study.
varied from 1 to 3 sessions/week.	RCTs varied in quality and included an array of low impact
Measures Steps: No	therapeutic exercise interventions of varying cardiovascular
Measures Bouts: No	intensity. There was no evidence of serious adverse events,
Examines HIIT: No	increases in pain, decreases in physical function,
Outcomes Addressed: Pain: Western	progression of structural OA on imaging or increased TKR at
Ontario and McMaster Universities	group level. The case control study concluded that
Osteoarthritis Index (WOMAC) pain	increasing levels of regular physical activity was associated
scale and numerical pain scales.	with lower risk of progression to TKR. CONCLUSIONS: Long-
Physical function: WOMAC function	term therapeutic exercise lasting 3 to 30 months is safe for
and various objective function tests.	most older adults with knee pain. This evidence supports
Measures of osteoarthritis progression	current clinical guideline recommendations. However, most
from imaging of the tibiofemoral joint:	studies investigated selected, consenting older adults
from imaging of the tibiofemoral joint: Kellgren and Lawrence score, joint	studies investigated selected, consenting older adults carrying out low impact therapeutic exercise which may
from imaging of the tibiofemoral joint: Kellgren and Lawrence score, joint space width, joint space narrowing,	studies investigated selected, consenting older adults carrying out low impact therapeutic exercise which may affect result generalizability. SYSTEMATIC REVIEW
from imaging of the tibiofemoral joint: Kellgren and Lawrence score, joint space width, joint space narrowing, osteoarthritis severity, and cartilage	studies investigated selected, consenting older adults carrying out low impact therapeutic exercise which may affect result generalizability. SYSTEMATIC REVIEW REGISTRATION: PROSPERO 2014:CRD42014006913.
from imaging of the tibiofemoral joint: Kellgren and Lawrence score, joint space width, joint space narrowing, osteoarthritis severity, and cartilage volume.	studies investigated selected, consenting older adults carrying out low impact therapeutic exercise which may affect result generalizability. SYSTEMATIC REVIEW REGISTRATION: PROSPERO 2014:CRD42014006913.
from imaging of the tibiofemoral joint: Kellgren and Lawrence score, joint space width, joint space narrowing, osteoarthritis severity, and cartilage volume. Examine Cardiorespiratory Fitness as	studies investigated selected, consenting older adults carrying out low impact therapeutic exercise which may affect result generalizability. SYSTEMATIC REVIEW REGISTRATION: PROSPERO 2014:CRD42014006913.
from imaging of the tibiofemoral joint: Kellgren and Lawrence score, joint space width, joint space narrowing, osteoarthritis severity, and cartilage volume. Examine Cardiorespiratory Fitness as Outcome: No	studies investigated selected, consenting older adults carrying out low impact therapeutic exercise which may affect result generalizability. SYSTEMATIC REVIEW REGISTRATION: PROSPERO 2014:CRD42014006913.
from imaging of the tibiofemoral joint: Kellgren and Lawrence score, joint space width, joint space narrowing, osteoarthritis severity, and cartilage volume. Examine Cardiorespiratory Fitness as Outcome: No Populations Analyzed: Mean age >45,	studies investigated selected, consenting older adults carrying out low impact therapeutic exercise which may affect result generalizability. SYSTEMATIC REVIEW REGISTRATION: PROSPERO 2014:CRD42014006913. Author-Stated Funding Source: National Institute for Health
from imaging of the tibiofemoral joint: Kellgren and Lawrence score, joint space width, joint space narrowing, osteoarthritis severity, and cartilage volume. Examine Cardiorespiratory Fitness as Outcome: No Populations Analyzed: Mean age >45, Knee pain and/or a diagnosis of	studies investigated selected, consenting older adults carrying out low impact therapeutic exercise which may affect result generalizability. SYSTEMATIC REVIEW REGISTRATION: PROSPERO 2014:CRD42014006913. Author-Stated Funding Source: National Institute for Health Research, Arthritis Research (UK).

Progression				
Meta-Analysis				
Citation: Timmins KA, Lee	ch RD, Batt ME, Edwards KL. Running and knee osteoarthritis: a systematic			
review and meta-analysis.	. Am J Sports Med. 2016;45(6):1447-1457. doi:10.1177/0363546516657531.			
Purpose: To determine,	Abstract: BACKGROUND: Osteoarthritis (OA) is a chronic condition			
from the published	characterized by pain, impaired function, and reduced quality of life. A			
literature, the role of	number of risk factors for knee OA have been identified, such as obesity,			
running in the	occupation, and injury. The association between knee OA and physical			
development of knee	activity or particular sports such as running is less clear. Previous reviews,			
osteoarthritis.	and the evidence that informs them, present contradictory or inconclusive			
Timeframe: Inception-	findings. PURPOSE: This systematic review aimed to determine the			
November 2015	association between running and the development of knee OA. STUDY			
Total # of Studies: 15 (3	DESIGN: Systematic review and meta-analysis. METHODS: Four electronic			
in meta-analysis)	databases were searched, along with citations in eligible articles and			
Exposure Definition:	reviews and the contents of recent journal issues. Two reviewers			
Any form of running or	independently screened the titles and abstracts using prespecified			
jogging (including	eligibility criteria. Full-text articles were also independently assessed for			
running-related sports	eligibility. Eligible studies were those in which running or running-related			
such as triathlon and	sports (eg, triathlon or orienteering) were assessed as a risk factor for the			
orienteering) assessed	onset or progression of knee OA in adults. Relevant outcomes included (1)			
by questionnaires.	diagnosis of knee OA, (2) radiographic markers of knee OA, (3) knee joint			
Measures Steps: No	surgery for OA, (4) knee pain, and (5) knee-associated disability. Risk of			
Measures Bouts: No	bias was judged by use of the Newcastle-Ottawa scale. A random-effects			
Examines HIIT: No	meta-analysis was performed with case-control studies investigating			
Outcomes Addressed:	arthroplasty. RESULTS: After de-duplication, the search returned 1322			
Radiographic and	records. Of these, 153 full-text articles were assessed; 25 were eligible,			
imaging markers of	describing 15 studies: 11 cohort (6 retrospective) and 4 case-control			
osteoarthritis (e.g.,	studies. Findings of studies with a diagnostic OA outcome were mixed.			
osteophytes, sclerosis,	Some radiographic differences were observed in runners, but only at			
cartilage thickness,	baseline within some subgroups. Meta-analysis suggested a protective			
volume, or surface	effect of running against surgery due to OA: pooled odds ratio 0.46 (95%			
area). Knee	Cl, 0.30-0.71). The I2 was 0% (95% Cl, 0%-73%). Evidence relating to			
arthroplasty: attained	symptomatic outcomes was sparse and inconclusive. CONCLUSION: With			
from registries. Knee	this evidence, it is not possible to determine the role of running in knee			
pain and knee-	OA. Moderate- to low-quality evidence suggests no association with OA			
associated disability:	diagnosis, a positive association with OA diagnosis, and a negative			
questionnaires.	association with knee OA surgery. Conflicting results may reflect			
Examine	methodological heterogeneity. More evidence from well-designed,			
Cardiorespiratory	prospective studies is needed to clarify the contradictions.			
Fitness as Outcome: No				
Populations Analyzed:	Author-Stated Funding Source: Arthritis Research UK.			
Adults, Osteoarthritis				

Table 3. Existing Systematic Review and Meta-Analyses Quality Assessment Chart

AMSTARExBP: SR/MA								
	Bartels, 2016	Beumer, 2016	Chang, 2016	Escalante, 2011	Fransen, 2015	Juhl, 2014	Quicke, 2015	Timmins, 2016
Review questions and inclusion/exclusion criteria delineated prior to executing search strategy.	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
Population variables defined and considered in methods.	No	No	No	Yes	No	Yes	No	No
Comprehensive literature search performed.	Yes	Yes	Partially Yes	Partially Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
Duplicate study selection and data extraction performed.	Yes	No	No	No	Yes	No	Yes	Yes
Search strategy clearly described.	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
Relevant grey literature included in review.	Yes	Yes	No	No	Yes	Yes	Yes	No
List of studies (included and excluded) provided.	Yes	No	No	No	Yes	No	No	No
Characteristics of included	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
FITT defined and examined in relation to outcome effect sizes.	No	No	No	No	No	Yes	N/A	No
Scientific quality (risk of bias) of included studies assessed and documented.	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
Results depended on study quality, either overall, or in interaction with moderators.	No	No	No	Yes	Yes	Yes	No	No
Scientific quality used appropriately in formulating conclusions.	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
Data appropriately synthesized and if applicable, heterogeneity assessed.	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	N/A	Yes
Effect size index chosen justified, statistically.	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	N/A	Yes
Individual-level meta- analysis used.	No	No	No	No	No	No	N/A	No
Practical recommendations clearly addressed.	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
Likelihood of publication bias assessed.	No	No	Yes	No	No	Yes	No	No
Conflict of interest disclosed.	Yes	No	Yes	No	Yes	No	Yes	Yes

Original Research

Table 4. Original Research Individual Evidence Summary Tables

Progression				
Original Research				
Citation: Dore DA, Winzenberg TM, Ding C, et al. The association between objectively measured				
physical activity and knee structural change using MRI. Ann Rheum Dis. 2013;72(7):1170–1175.				
doi:10.1136/annrheumdis-2012-201691.				
Purpose: To examine the longitudin	al association between objectively assessed PA and knee			
structural change using magnetic resonance imaging (MRI).				
Study Design: Prospective cohort Abstract: OBJECTIVES: This study describes the longitudir				
study	association between objectively assessed physical activity (PA)			
Location: Tasmania	and knee structural change measured using MRI. METHODS: 405			
Sample: 405	community-dwelling adults aged 51-81 years were measured at			
Attrition Rate: 53.71%	baseline and approximately 2.7 years later. MRI of the right			
Sample Power: Not reported	knee at baseline and follow-up was performed to evaluate bone			
Exposure Measurement	marrow lesions (BMLs), meniscal pathology, cartilage defects,			
Device-Measured: Pedometer,	and cartilage volume. PA was assessed at baseline by pedometer			
steps/day, averaged from two	(steps/day). RESULTS: Doing >/=10 000 steps/day was			
7-day wear periods, 6 months	associated with BML increases (RR 1.97, 95% CI 1.19 to 3.27,			
apart. Measured continuously and	p=0.009). Participants doing >/=10 000 steps/day had a 1.52			
dichotomized by <10,000 or	times (95% Cl 1.05 to 2.20, p=0.027) greater risk of increasing			
≥10,000 steps/day.	meniscal pathology score, which increased to 2.49 (95% CI 1.05			
Measures Steps: Yes	to 3.93, p=0.002) in those with adverse meniscal pathology at			
Measures Bouts: No	baseline. Doing >/=10 000 steps/day was associated with a			
	greater risk of increasing cartilage defect score in those with			
	prevalent BMLs at baseline (RR 1.36, 95% Cl 1.03 to 1.69,			
	p=0.013). Steps/day was protective against volume loss in those			
	with more baseline cartilage volume but led to increased			
	cartilage loss in those with less baseline cartilage volume.			
	(p=0.046 for interaction). CONCLUSIONS: PA was deleteriously			
	associated with knee structural change, especially in those with			
	pre-existing knee structural abnormalities. This suggests			
	individuals with knee abnormalities should avoid doing >/=10			
	000 steps/day. Alternatives to weight-bearing activity may be			
	needed in order to maintain PA levels required for other aspects			
	of health.			
Refers to Other Materials: Yes	Outcomes Examined: MRI at baseline and follow-up: bone			
Adverse Events Addressed:	marrow lesions, meniscal damage, cartilage defects, tibial			
Examine Cardiorespiratory Fitness	plateau bone area. Knee injury and surgery questions. Presence			
as Outcome: No	of radiographic osteoarthritis, defined as any score ≥1 for joint			
	space narrowing or osetophytes.			
Populations Analyzed: Adults 50–	Author-Stated Funding Source: National Health and Medical			
80, Subjects with and without pre-	Research Council of Australia, Tasmanian Community Fund,			
existing knee abnormalities (56–	Masonic Centenary Medical Research Foundation, Royal Hobart			
58% with knee osteoarthritis).	Hospital Research Foundation, Arthritis Foundation of Australia.			

Chronic Conditions Subcommittee: Q2. In individuals with osteoarthritis, what is the relationship between physical activity and (1) risk of co-morbid conditions, (2) physical function, (3) health-related quality of life, (4) disease progression, and (5) pain?

Progression		
Original Research		
Citation: Felson DT, Niu J, Yang T, et al. Physical activity, alignment and knee osteoarthritis: data from		
MOST and the OAI. Osteoarthritis Cartilage	e. 2013;21(6):789–795. doi:10.1016/j.joca.2013.03.001.	
Purpose: To determine the effect of PA on knee osteoarthritis development in persons without knee		
injury and according to knee alignment.		
Study Design: Prospective cohort study	Abstract: OBJECTIVE: To determine the effect of physical	
Location: United States	activity on knee osteoarthritis (OA) development in	
Sample: 2,073	persons without knee injury and according to knee	
Attrition Rate: 0.00%	alignment. DESIGN: We combined data from Multicenter	
Sample Power: Not reported	Osteoarthritis (MOST) and Osteoarthritis Initiative (OAI),	
Exposure Measurement Self-Reported: Physical Activity Scale for	long limb and repeated posteroanterior knee radiographs and completed the physical activity survey for the elderly	
the Elderly, created quartiles of activity.	(PASE). We studied persons without radiographic OA and	
Measures Steps: No	excluded knees with major injury and without long limb	
Measures Bouts: No	films. We followed subjects 30 months (in MOST) and 48 months (in OAI) for one of two incident outcomes: (1) symptomatic tibiofemoral OA (radiographic OA and knee pain), or (2) tibiofemoral narrowing. 'Active' persons were those with PASE score in the highest quartile by gender. We examined risk of OA in active group using logistic regression adjusting for age, gender, body mass index (BMI), Western Ontario and McMaster Arthritis Index (WOMAC) pain score, Kellgren and Lawrence (KL) grade (0 or 1), and study of origin. We also analyzed knees from malaligned and neutrally aligned limbs. RESULTS: The combined sample comprised 2,073 subjects (3,542 knees) with mean age 61 years. The cumulative incidence of symptomatic tibiofemoral OA was 1.12% in the active group vs 1.82% in the others (odds ratio (OR) among active group 0.6, 95% confidence interval (CI) 0.3, 1.3).	
	Joint space narrowing occurred in 3.41% of knees in the active group vs 4.04% in the others (OR among active group 0.9 (95% CI 0.5, 1.5)). Results did not differ by alignment status. CONCLUSIONS: Physical activity in the highest quartile did not affect the risk of developing OA.	
Refers to Other Materials: Yes	Outcomes Examined: Disease progression: the new	
Examine Cardiorespiratory Fitness as	combination of frequent knee pain and radiographic	
Outcome: No	osteoarthritis.	
Populations Analyzed: Adults mean age	Author-Stated Funding Source: National Institutes of	
61, With or at high risk of knee	Health, Merck Research Laboratories, Novartis	
osteoarthritis.	Pharmaceuticals Corporation, GlaxoSmithKline, Pfizer.	

Progression		
Original Research		
Citation: Kwee RM, Wirth W, Hafezi-Nejad N, Zikria BA, Guermazi A, Demehri S. Role of physical		
activity in cartilage damage progression	of subjects with baseline full-thickness cartilage defects in	
medial tibiofemoral compartment: data	from the Osteoarthritis Initiative. Osteoarthritis Cartilage.	
2016;24(11):1898–1904. doi:10.1016/j.j	oca.2016.06.009.	
Purpose: To assess the association betw	een PA and cartilage damage progression in the medial	
tibiofemoral compartment, using 2-year	follow-up magnetic resonance imaging (MRI) in subjects with	
subchondral bones at the central weight	t-bearing medial femur detected at baseline MRI examination.	
Study Design: Prospective cohort	Abstract: OBJECTIVE: To assess the association between	
study	physical activity and cartilage damage progression in medial	
Location: Not reported	tibiofemoral compartment (MTFC) using 2-year follow-up	
Sample: 100	magnetic resonance imaging (MRI) in subjects with denuded	
Attrition Rate: 0.79%	areas of subchondral bone (dABs) at the central weight-	
Sample Power: Yes	bearing medial femur (cMF) at baseline MRI examination.	
Exposure Measurement	METHODS: One hundred subjects from the Osteoarthritis	
Self-Reported: 7-day recall using the	Initiative (OAI) progression cohort with dABs at the cMF at	
Physical Activity Scale for the Elderly	3T MRI at baseline (51% men; mean age 62.2 years, range	
Measures Stens: No	45-79) were included. Sagittal 3D dual-echo steady-state	
Measures Bouts: No	with water excitation images were used to assess 2-year	
	MTFC cartilage change. Associations between 2-year	
	average Physical Activity Scale for the Elderly (PASE) and 2-	
	year MTFC cartilage change were assessed by linear	
	regression analysis. Subgroup analyses were performed.	
	RESULTS: No associations between PASE and 2-year MTFC	
	cartilage change were observed in the entire cohort.	
	Similarly, in the subgroup with cartilage loss during the 2	
	years, the non-refuted confidence intervals for the	
	regression coefficients were tightly clustered around the null	
	value (regression coefficients for: mean cMF.ThCtAB = -	
	0.00059; 98.75% CI: -0.00130 to 0.00012), cMF.dAB% =	
	0.02176; 98.75% CI: -0.02514 to 0.06865, Mean MT.ThCtAB	
	= -0.00013; 98.75% CI: -0.00064 to 0.00038, MT.dAB% =	
	0.02543; 98.75% CI: -0.01485 to 0.06571. CONCLUSION: In	
	the entire group of subjects with dABs at the cMF at	
	baseline, no association between physical activity and 2-year	
	MTFC cartilage change was detected. Due to the limited	
	sample size of our study, small-sized effects may not have	
	been detected in our study.	
Refers to Other Materials: No	Outcomes Examined: Disease progression: Percentage of	
Examine Cardiorespiratory Fitness as	denuded areas of subchondral bone at the medial tibia,	
Outcome: No	mean cartilage thickness over total subchondral bone area	
	at the medial tibia, and mean cartilage thickness over total	
	subchondral bone area at the central medial femur.	
Populations Analyzed: Adults 45–79,	Author-Stated Funding Source: No funding source used.	
Osteoarthritis	-	

Progression		
Original Research		
Citation: Lin W, Alizai H, Joseph GB, et al. Physical activity in relation to knee cartilage T2 progression		
measured with 3 T MRI over a period o	f 4 years: data from the Osteoarthritis Initiative. Osteoarthritis	
Cartilage. 2013;21(10):1558–1566. doi:10.1016/j.joca.2013.06.022.		
Purpose: To analyze the longitudinal as	sociation between PA levels and early degenerative cartilage	
changes in the knee, measured using T	2 relaxation times over a period of 4 years in individuals	
without clinical or radiographic evidence	ce of osteoarthritis.	
Study Design: Prospective cohort	Abstract: OBJECTIVE: The purpose of this study was to	
study	analyze the longitudinal association between physical activity	
Location: United States	levels and early degenerative cartilage changes in the knee,	
Sample: 205	measured using T2 relaxation times over a period of 4 years	
Attrition Bate: 0.16%	in individuals without clinical or radiographic evidence of OA.	
Sample Power: Yes	DESIGN: Cartilage T2 was measured at baseline and after 2	
Exposure Measurement	and 4 years in 205 subjects aged 45-60 years from the	
Self-Reported: Physical Activity Scale	Osteoarthritis Initiative (OAI) incidence and normal cohorts	
for the Elderly questionnaire	with no knee pain (Western Ontario and McMaster	
assessed over last 7 days: included	Universities Osteoarthritis Index (WOMAC) score of zero).	
household occupational and leisure	and a Kellgren Lawrence (KL) score of <2 at baseline. Physical	
time PA Created tertiles for	activity was scored using the Physical Activity Scale for the	
assessment	Elderly (PASE) questionnaire, which was obtained yearly over	
Measures Steps: No	4 years. The relationship between physical activity and T2	
Measures Bouts: No	was studied using a mixed model linear regression, including	
	random effects, and adjusted for age, sex, and body mass	
	index (BMI). RESULTS: T2 values for all PASE tertiles	
	progressed over the 4-year period. T2 progression was	
	increased in the highest tertile of physical activity compared	
	to the mid-tertile at the medial tibia (MT) ($P = 0.041$), patella	
	(Pat) ($P = 0.019$), and average T2 of all knee compartments	
	combined ($P = 0.033$). Subjects with the lowest 15% PASE	
	scores showed significantly higher T2 progression compared	
	to the mid-level physical activity group at the lateral femur	
	(LF) (P = 0.025), lateral tibia (LT) (P = 0.043), medial femur	
	(MF) ($P = 0.044$), tibiofemoral compartment ($P = 0.017$).	
	patellofemoral compartment ($P = 0.016$), lateral	
	compartments ($P = 0.003$), and average of all compartments	
	(P = 0.043). CONCLUSION: High and very low PASE scores	
	were associated with greater progression of cartilage T2	
	measurements in asymptomatic, middle-aged individuals.	
	suggesting accelerated cartilage matrix biochemical	
	degeneration over time	
Refers to Other Materials: No	Outcomes Examined: T2 relaxation time (disease	
Examine Cardiorespiratory Fitness as	progression): assessed radiographically.	
Outcome: No		
Dopulations Analyzed: Adults 45, 60	Author Stated Funding Source: National Institutes of Useth	
ropulations Analyzed: Adults 45–60	Author-Stated Funding Source: National Institutes of Health,	
	Osteoarthritis initiative.	

Progression		
Original Research		
Citation: Oiestad BE, Quinn E, White, et al. No association between daily walking and knee structural changes in people at risk of or with mild knee osteoarthritis. Prospective data from the Multicenter Osteoarthritis Study. <i>J Rheumatol</i> . 2015;42(9):1685–1693. doi:10.3899/jrheum.150071.		
Purpose: To examine the association of objectively measured daily walking with structural change 2 years later in people at rick of or with mild knee osteo arthritic		
Study Design: Prospective cohort study	Abstract: OBJECTIVE: We investigated the association between objectively measured daily walking and knee structural change,	
Location: United States Sample: 779 Attrition Rate: 0.74%	defined either as radiographic worsening or as cartilage loss, in people at risk of or with knee osteoarthritis (OA). METHODS: Participants from the Multicenter Osteoarthritis Study (MOST) with	
Sample Power: Not reported Exposure Measurement	Kellgren-Lawrence grades 0-2 and daily walking (measured with the StepWatch) at the 60-month visit were included. Participants had fixed flexion weight bearing radiographs and know magnetic	
Self-Reported: Device-Measured: Accelerometer, average steps/day. Steps were also divided into tertiles of low, moderate, and high levels of daily walking. Minutes per day of walking, with moderate-to- vigorous PA characterized as walking at a frequency of >100 steps/minute. Measures Steps: Yes Measures Bouts: No	fixed-flexion, weight-bearing radiographs and knee magnetic resonance images (MRI) at 60 and 84 months. Radiographic worsening was read in both knees using the Osteoarthritis Research Society International grading, and MRI were read for 1 knee using the Whole-Organ MRI Score semiquantitative scoring. OR and 95% CI were calculated comparing those in the middle tertile against the lowest and highest tertiles of daily walking using logistic regression models and generalized estimating equations. Data on walking with moderate to vigorous intensity (min with > 100 steps/min/day) were associated to structural change using multivariate and logistic regression models. RESULTS: The 1179 study participants (59% women) were 67.0 years old (+/- 7.6), with a mean (+/- SD) body mass index of 29.8 kg/m(2) (+/- 5.3) who walked 6981 (+/- 2630) steps/day. After adjusting for confounders, we found no significant associations between daily walking and radiographic worsening or cartilage loss. More time spent walking at a moderate to vigorous intensity was not associated with either radiographic worsening or cartilage loss. CONCLUSION: Results from the MOST study indicated no association between daily walking and structural changes over 2	
Refers to Other Materials: No Adverse Events Addressed: Examine Cardiorespiratory Fitness as Outcome: No	Outcomes Examined: Cartilage loss: Whole-Organ MRI Score (WORMS) measured by knee magnetic resonance images (MRIs). Radiographic worsening: standing posterior-anterior and lateral radiographs were taken using SynaFlexer graded according to the KL classification system (grade 0–4) (posteroanterior view), and the Osteoarthritis Research Society International (OARSI) atlas (posteroanterior and lateral view).	
Populations Analyzed: Adults 50–79, Subjects at high risk of or with osteoarthritis diagnosis (Kellgren and Lawrence grades <3)	Author-Stated Funding Source: National Institutes of Health, National Institute on Aging.	

Table 5. Original Research Bias Assessment Chart

	Dore, 2013	Felson, 2013	Kwee, 2016	Lin, 2013	Oiestad, 2015
(???) = Can't Determine					
Inclusion/exclusion criteria similar across	Yes	Yes	Yes	N/A	Yes
study groups.					
Strategy for recruiting or allocating	Yes	Yes	Yes	N/A	Yes
Allocation sequence randomly					
generated	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A
Group allocation concealed (i.e.,					
assignments could not be predicted).	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A
Distribution of critical confounding					
factors similar across study groups at	Voc	Voc	Voc	Voc	Voc
baseline, or analysis controlled for	Tes	res	res	res	res
differences between groups.					
Accounted for variations in execution of					
study from proposed protocol or	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A
research plan.					
Adherence to study protocols similar	Yes	Yes	Yes	N/A	Yes
across study groups.				,	
Investigators accounted for unintended					
concurrent exposures that were	No	N/A	N/A	N/A	No
differentially experienced by study					
groups and might bias results.					
or exposure status	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A
Investigators blinded to participants'					
intervention or exposure status	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A
Outcome assessors blinded to					
participants' intervention or exposure	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A
status.	,	,	,	,	,
Valid and reliable measures used					
consistently across study groups to	Vec	Vec	Vec	Vec	Vec
assess inclusion/exclusion criteria,	res	res	res	res	res
exposures, outcomes, and confounders.					
Length of follow-up similar across study	Ves	Ves	Yes	Ves	Yes
groups.	103	103	103	103	105
In cases of high or differential loss to		,			
follow-up, impact assessed through	No	N/A	No	???	Yes
sensitivity analysis or other adjustment.					
Other sources of bias taken into account					
in design and/or analysis of study	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
adjustment					
Adequate statistical methods used to					
assess primary outcomes.	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes

Appendices

Appendix A: Analytical Framework

<u>Topic Area</u>

Chronic Conditions

Systematic Review Question

In individuals with osteoarthritis, what is the relationship between physical activity and (1) risk of co-morbid conditions, (2) physical function, (3) health-related quality of life, (4) disease progression, and (5) pain?

- a. Is there a dose-response relationship? If yes, what is the shape of the relationship?
- b. Does the relationship vary by age, sex, race/ethnicity, socio-economic status, or weight status?
- c. Does the relationship vary based on: frequency, duration, intensity, type (mode), or how physical activity is measured?

Population

Individuals of all ages with osteoarthritis

Intervention/Exposure

All types and intensities of physical activity

Comparison

Individuals with osteoarthritis who participate in varying levels of physical activity

Endpoint Health Outcomes

- Risk of co-morbid conditions
- Physical function
- Health-related quality of life
- Disease progression
- Pain

Key Definitions

- Risk of co-morbid conditions: The chance of having one or more additional conditions.
- Physical function: "Physical function" and "physical functioning" are regarded as synonyms that refer to: "the ability of a person to move around and to perform types of physical activity."
 - For example, measures of physical function include measures of ability to walk (e.g., usually gait speed), run, climb stairs, carry groceries, sweep the floor, stand up, and bathe oneself.
 - As measures of behavioral abilities, physical function measures do not include:
 - Physiologic measures, including measures of physiologic capacity (e.g., maximal lung capacities, maximal aerobic capacity, maximal muscle strength, bone density).
 - Measures of the environment or of the host-environmental interaction (e.g., disability accommodation).
 - Measures of what a person usually does (e.g., physical activity level) (as opposed to what a person is capable of doing).

22

- Health-related quality of life: "Health-related quality of life (HRQOL) is a multi-dimensional concept that includes domains related to physical, mental, emotional, and social functioning." Source: HealthyPeople.gov https://www.healthypeople.gov/2020/topics-objectives/topic/healthrelated-quality-of-life-well-being
- Disease progression: A change or worsening of a disease over time.

Appendix B: Final Search Strategy

Search Strategy: PubMed (Systematic Reviews, Meta-Analyses, Pooled Analyses, and High-Quality Reports)

Database: PubMed; Date of Search: 2/7/17; 271 results

Set	Search Terms
Limit: Language	(English[lang])
Limit: Exclude animal only	NOT ("Animals"[Mesh] NOT ("Animals"[Mesh] AND "Humans"[Mesh]))
Limit: Publication Date (Systematic Reviews/Meta- Analyses)	AND ("2011/01/01"[PDAT] : "3000/12/31"[PDAT])
Limit: Publication Type Include (Systematic Reviews/Meta- Analyses)	AND (systematic[sb] OR meta-analysis[pt] OR "systematic review"[tiab] OR "systematic literature review"[tiab] OR metaanalysis[tiab] OR "meta analysis"[tiab] OR metanalyses[tiab] OR "meta analyses"[tiab] OR "pooled analysis"[tiab] OR "pooled analyses"[tiab] OR "pooled data"[tiab])
Limit: Publication Type Exclude (Systematic Reviews/Meta-	NOT ("comment" [Publication Type] OR "editorial" [Publication
Analyses)	Type])
Osteoartnritis	AND (("Osteoarthritis"[mh] OR "Osteoarthritis"[tiab] OR "Degenerative joint disease"[tiab] OR "Osteoarthritic"[tiab] OR "Osteophytosis"[tiab]) OR (("Degenerative Arthritides"[tiab] OR "Degenerative Arthritis"[tiab] OR "Osteoarthritides"[tiab] OR "Osteoarthroses"[tiab] OR "Osteoarthrosis"[tiab] OR "Osteoarthrosis Deformans"[tiab] OR "Wear and tear arthritis"[tiab]) NOT medline[sb]))
Physical Activity	AND ("Aerobic activities"[tiab] OR "Aerobic activity"[tiab] OR "Cardiovascular activities"[tiab] OR "Cardiovascular activity"[tiab] OR "Endurance activities"[tiab] OR "Endurance activity"[tiab] OR "Exercise"[mh] OR "Exercise"[tiab] OR "Functional training"[tiab] OR "leisure-time physical activity"[tiab] OR "Lifestyle activities"[tiab] OR "Lifestyle activity"[tiab] OR "Muscle stretching exercises"[mh] OR "Physical activity"[tiab] OR "Physical conditioning"[tiab] OR "Qi gong"[tiab] OR "Recreational activities"[tiab] OR "Recreational activity"[tiab] OR "Resistance training"[tiab] OR "Strength training"[tiab] OR "Tai chi"[tiab] OR "Tai ji"[mh] OR "Tai ji"[tiab] OR "Walk"[tiab] OR "Free living activities"[tiab] OR "Free living activity"[tiab] OR "Sedentary"[tiab] OR "Sedentary lifestyle"[mh])

Search Strategy: CINAHL (Systematic Reviews, Meta-Analyses, Pooled Analyses, and High-Quality Reports)

Database: CINAHL; Date of Search: 2/7/17; 13 results

Terms	searched	in	title	٥r	abstract
ICIIIIS	searcheu		uue	UI.	abstract

Set	Search Terms
Limits	2011-present English language Peer reviewed Exclude Medline records Human
Limit: Publication Type Include (Systematic Reviews/Meta- Analyses)	("systematic review" OR "systematic literature review" OR "metaanalysis" OR "meta analysis" OR metanalyses OR "meta analyses" OR "pooled analysis" OR "pooled analyses" OR "pooled data")
Physical Activity	("Aerobic activities" OR "Aerobic activity" OR "Cardiovascular activities" OR "Cardiovascular activity" OR "Endurance activities" OR "Endurance activity" OR "Exercise" OR "Functional training" OR "leisure-time physical activity" OR "Lifestyle activities" OR "Lifestyle activity" OR "muscle stretching exercises" OR "Physical activity" OR "Physical conditioning" OR "Qi gong" OR "Recreational activities" OR "Recreational activity" OR "Resistance training" OR "Strength training" OR "Tai chi" OR "Tai ji" OR "Walk" OR "Walking" OR "Yoga" OR "Free living activities" OR "Free living activity" OR "Sedentary")
Osteoarthritis	AND ("Osteoarthritis" OR "Osteoarthritis" OR "Degenerative joint disease" OR "Degenerative Arthritides" OR "Degenerative Arthritis" OR "Osteoarthritic" OR "Osteoarthritides" OR "Osteoarthroses" OR "Osteoarthrosis" OR "Osteoarthrosis Deformans" OR "Osteophytosis" OR "Wear and tear arthritis")

Search Strategy: Cochrane (Systematic Reviews, Meta-Analyses, Pooled Analyses, and High-Quality Reports)

Database: Cochrane; Date of Search: 2/7/17; 50 results Terms searched in title, abstract, or keywords

Set	Search Terms	
Limits	2011-present	
	Word variations not searched	
	Cochrane Reviews (Reviews) and Other Reviews	
	AND ("Aerobic activities" OR "Aerobic activity" OR	
	"Cardiovascular activities" OR "Cardiovascular activity" OR	
	"Endurance activities" OR "Endurance activity" OR "Exercise" OR	
	"Functional training" OR "leisure-time physical activity" OR	
	"Lifestyle activities" OR "Lifestyle activity" OR "muscle stretching	
	exercises" OR "Physical activity" OR "Physical conditioning" OR	
	"Qi gong" OR "Recreational activities" OR "Recreational activity"	
	OR "Resistance training" OR "strength training" OR "Tai chi" OR	
	"Tai ji" OR "Walk" OR "Walking" OR "Yoga" OR "Free living	
Physical Activity	activities" OR "Free living activity" OR "Sedentary")	
	AND ("Osteoarthritis" OR "Osteoarthritis" OR "Degenerative	
	joint disease" OR "Degenerative Arthritides" OR "Degenerative	
	Arthritis" OR "Osteoarthritic" OR "Osteoarthritides" OR	
	"Osteoarthroses" OR "Osteoarthrosis" OR "Osteoarthrosis	
Osteoarthritis	Deformans" OR "Osteophytosis" OR "Wear and tear arthritis")	

Search Strategy: PubMed (Original Research)

Set	Search Terms
Limit: Language	(English[lang])
Limit: Exclude animal only	NOT ("Animals"[Mesh] NOT ("Animals"[Mesh] AND
	"Humans"[Mesh]))
Limit: Publication Date (Original)	
	AND ("2006/01/01"[PDAT] : "3000/12/31"[PDAT])
Limit: Publication Type Exclude	NOT ("comment" [Publication Type] OR "editorial" [Publication
(Original)	Type] OR "review" [Publication Type] OR systematic[sb] OR
	"meta-analysis"[publication type] OR "systematic review"[tiab]
	OR "systematic literature review" [tiab] OR metaanalysis [tiab] OR
	"meta analysis"[tiab] OR metanalyses[tiab] OR "meta
	analyses"[tiab] OR "pooled analysis"[tiab] OR "pooled
	analyses"[tiab] OR "pooled data"[tiab])
Osteoarthritis	AND (("Osteoarthritis"[mh] OR "Osteoarthritis"[tiab] OR
	"Degenerative joint disease"[tiab] OR "Osteoarthritic"[tiab] OR
	"Osteophytosis"[tiab]) OR (("Degenerative Arthritides"[tiab] OR
	"Degenerative Arthritis"[tiab] OR "Osteoarthritides"[tiab] OR
	"Osteoarthroses"[tiab] OR "Osteoarthrosis"[tiab] OR
	"Osteoarthrosis Deformans"[tiab] OR "Wear and tear
	arthritis"[tiab]) NOI medline[sb]))
Physical Activity	AND ("Aerobic activities"[tiab] OR "Aerobic activity"[tiab] OR
	Cardiovascular activities [tiab] OR Cardiovascular
	activity [tiab] OR "Evergice"[mb] OP "Evergice"[tiab] OP
	"Functional training"[tiah] OR "leisure-time physical
	activity"[tiah] OR "Lifestyle activities"[tiah] OR "Lifestyle
	activity"[tiab] OR "muscle stretching exercises"[mh] OR "Physical
	activity"[tiab] OR "Physical conditioning"[tiab] OR "Qi
	gong"[tiab] OR "Recreational activities"[tiab] OR "Recreational
	activity"[tiab] OR "Resistance training"[tiab] OR "strength
	training"[tiab] OR "Tai chi"[tiab] OR "Tai ji"[mh] OR "Tai ji"[tiab]
	OR "Walk"[tiab] OR "Walking"[tiab] OR "Yoga"[mh] OR
	"Yoga"[tiab] OR "Free living activities"[tiab] OR "Free living
	activity"[tiab] OR "Sedentary"[tiab] OR "Sedentary
	lifestyle"[mh])
Progression	AND ("Disease Progression"[mh] OR "Progression"[tiab] OR
	"Progressive OA"[tiab] OR "Progressive Osteoarthritis"[tiab] OR
	"Acceleration"[tiab] OR "Progresses"[tiab] OR "Progressive
	disease"[tiab])

Database: PubMed; Date of Search: 6/26/17; 301 results

Search Strategy: CINAHL (Original)

Database: CINAHL; Date of Search: 6/26/17; 15 results Terms searched in title or abstract

Set	Search Terms
Limits	2006-present
	English language
	Peer reviewed
	Exclude Medline records
	Human
Limit: Publication Type Exclude	("systematic review" OR "systematic literature review" OR
(Original)	"metaanalysis" OR "meta analysis" OR metanalyses OR "meta
	analyses" OR "pooled analysis" OR "pooled analyses" OR
	"pooled data")
Physical Activity	("Aerobic activities" OR "Aerobic activity" OR "Cardiovascular
	activities" OR "Cardiovascular activity" OR "Endurance activities"
	OR "Endurance activity" OR "Exercise" OR "Functional training"
	OR "leisure-time physical activity" OR "Lifestyle activities" OR
	"Lifestyle activity" OR "muscle stretching exercises" OR "Physical
	activity" OR "Physical conditioning" OR "Qi gong" OR
	"Recreational activities" OR "Recreational activity" OR
	"Resistance training" OR "strength training" OR "Tai chi" OR "Tai
	ji" OR "Walk" OR "Walking" OR "Yoga" OR "Free living activities"
	OR "Free living activity" OR "Sedentary")
Osteoarthritis	AND ("Osteoarthritis" OR "Osteoarthritis" OR "Degenerative
	joint disease" OR "Degenerative Arthritides" OR "Degenerative
	Arthritis" OR "Osteoarthritic" OR "Osteoarthritides" OR
	"Osteoarthroses" OR "Osteoarthrosis" OR "Osteoarthrosis
	Deformans" OR "Osteophytosis" OR "Wear and tear arthritis")
Progression	AND ("Progression" OR "Progressive OA" OR "Progressive
	Osteoarthritis" OR "Acceleration" OR "Progresses" OR
	"Progressive disease" OR "Accelerated development of" OR
	"Acceleration of knee" OR "Acceleration of hip" OR
	"Acceleration of spine")

Search Strategy: Cochrane (Original Research)

Database: Cochrane; Date of Search: 6-26/17; 114 results Terms searched in title, abstract, or keywords

Set	Search Terms	
Limits	2006-present	
	Word variations not searched	
	Trials	
Physical Activity	("Aerobic activities" OR "Aerobic activity" OR "Cardiovascular activities" OR "Cardiovascular activity" OR "Endurance activities" OR "Endurance activity" OR "Exercise" OR "Functional training" OR "leisure-time physical activity" OR "Lifestyle activities" OR "Lifestyle activity" OR "muscle stretching exercises" OR "Physical activity" OR "Physical conditioning" OR "Qi gong" OR "Recreational activities" OR "Recreational activity" OR "Resistance training" OR "Strength training" OR "Tai chi" OR "Tai ji" OR "Walk" OR "Walking" OR "Yoga" OR "Free living activities" OR "Free living activity" OR "Sedentary")	
Osteoarthritis	AND ("Osteoarthritis" OR "Osteoarthritis" OR "Degenerative joint disease" OR "Degenerative Arthritides" OR "Degenerative Arthritis" OR "Osteoarthritic" OR "Osteoarthritides" OR "Osteoarthroses" OR "Osteoarthrosis" OR "Osteoarthrosis Deformans" OR "Osteophytosis" OR "Wear and tear arthritis")	
Progression	AND ("Progression" OR "Progressive OA" OR "Progressive Osteoarthritis" OR "Acceleration" OR "Progresses" OR "Progressive disease" OR "Accelerated development of" OR "Acceleration of knee" OR "Acceleration of hip" OR "Acceleration of spine")	

Appendix C: Literature Tree

Existing Systematic Reviews, Meta-Analyses, Pooled Analyses, and Reports Literature Tree



Original Research Literature Tree



Appendix D: Inclusion/Exclusion Criteria

Chronic Conditions Subcommittee

Q2. In individuals with osteoarthritis, what is the relationship between physical activity and (1) risk of co-morbid conditions, (2) physical function, (3) health-related quality of life, (4) disease progression, and (5) pain?

- a. Is there a dose-response relationship? If yes, what is the shape of the relationship?
- b. Does the relationship vary by age, sex, race/ethnicity, socio-economic status, or weight status?
- c. Is the relationship based on: frequency, duration, intensity, type (mode), or how physical activity is measured?

Category	Inclusion/Exclusion Criteria	Notes/Rationale
Publication	Include:	
Language	 Studies published with full text in English 	
Publication Status	Include:	
	 Studies published in peer-reviewed journals 	
	• Reports determined to have appropriate suitability	
	and quality by PAGAC	
	Exclude:	
	 Grey literature, including unpublished data, 	
	manuscripts, abstracts, conference proceedings	
Research Type	Include:	
	Original research	
	Meta-analyses	
	Systematic reviews	
	Reports determined to have appropriate suitability	
	and quality by PAGAC	
Study Subjects	Include:	
	Human subjects	
Age of Study	Include:	
	People of all ages	
Health Status of	Include:	
Study Subjects	 Studies of people with osteoarthritis 	
	Evolude	
	• Studies that include osteoarthritis as part of the	
	study sample, but do not analyze results separately	
	for osteoarthritis only	
Date of	Include:	
Publication	 Systematic reviews, meta-analyses, pooled 	
	analyses, and reports published from 2011 to 2017	
	 Original research published from 2006 to 2017 	
Study Design	Include:	
	Systematic reviews	
	Meta-analyses	

	Pooled analyses	
	 PAGAC-approved reports 	
	Exclude:	
	 Randomized controlled trials 	
	 Prospective cohort studies 	
	Narrative reviews	
	Commentaries	
	Editorials	
	 Non-randomized controlled trials 	
	 Retrospective cohort studies 	
	Case-control studies	
	 Cross-sectional studies 	
	 Before-and-after studies 	
Intervention/	Include studies in which the exposure or	
Exposure	intervention is:	
	 All types and intensities of physical activity 	
	Exclude:	
	 Studies that do not include physical activity 	
	 Studies of multimodal interventions that do not 	
	present data on physical activity alone	
	 Studies of a single, acute session of exercise 	
	 Studies of a disease-specific therapeutic exercise 	
	delivered by a medical professional (e.g., physical	
	therapist)	
	 Studies with measures of physical fitness as the 	
	exposure	
Outcome	Systematic Review, Meta-Analysis, Pooled Analysis,	
	and Report Criteria:	
	Disk of comparished conditions	
	Risk of co-morbid conditions Physical function	
	 Physical function Lealth related quality of life 	
	Disease progression	
	• Falli	
	Original Research Criteria:	
	Include studies in which the outcome is:	
	Disease progression	

Appendix E: Rationale for Exclusion at Abstract or Full-Text Triage for Existing Systematic Reviews, Meta-Analyses, Pooled Analyses, and Reports

The table below lists the excluded articles with at least one reason for exclusion, but may not reflect all possible reasons.

Citation	Outcome	Population	Study Design	Exposure	Not ideal fit for replacement of de novo search	Other
Abdulla A, Adams N, Bone M, et al.						
Guidance on the management of pain						
in older people. Age Ageing.			х		Х	
2013;42(suppl 1):i1-57.						
doi:10.1093/ageing/afs200.						
Anwer S, Alghadir A, Brismee JM. Effect						
of home exercise program in patients						
with knee osteoarthritis: a systematic				v		
review and meta-analysis. J Geriatr				^		
Phys Ther. 2016;39(1):38–48.						
doi:10.1519/JPT.000000000000045.						
Anwer S, Alghadir A, Zafar H, Al-Eisa E.						
Effect of whole body vibration training						
on quadriceps muscle strength in						
individuals with knee osteoarthritis: a				х		
systematic review and meta-analysis.						
Physiotherapy. 2016;102(2):145-151.						
doi:10.1016/j.physio.2015.10.004.						
Arbesman M, Mosley LJ. Systematic						
review of occupation- and activity-						
based health management and						
maintenance interventions for				Х		
community-dwelling older adults. Am J						
Occup Ther. 2012;66(3):277-283.						
doi:10.5014/ajot.2012.003327.						
Arnold JB, Walters JL, Ferrar KE. Does						
physical activity increase after total hip						
or knee arthroplasty for osteoarthritis?	v				v	
A systematic review. J Orthop Sports	^				~	
Phys Ther. 2016;46(6):431-442.						
doi:10.2519/jospt.2016.6449.						
Barker AL, Talevski J, Morello RT, Brand						
CA, Rahmann AE, Urquhart DM.						
Effectiveness of aquatic exercise for						
musculoskeletal conditions: a meta-						Х
analysis. Arch Phys Med Rehabil.						
2014;95(9):1776-1786.						
doi:10.1016/j.apmr.2014.04.005.						
Bartels EM, Juhl CB, Christensen R, et						
al. Aquatic exercise for the treatment of						
knee and hip osteoarthritis. Cochrane						x
Database Syst Rev. 2016;(3):CD005523.						^
doi:10.1002/14651858.CD005523.pub3						

Citation	Outcome	Population	Study Design	Exposure	Not ideal fit for replacement of de novo search	Other
Batterham SI, Heywood S, Keating JL. Systematic review and meta-analysis comparing land and aquatic exercise for people with hip or knee arthritis on function, mobility and other health outcomes. <i>BMC Musculoskelet Disord</i> . June 2011;12:123. doi:10.1186/1471- 2474-12-123.		х				
Beaudreuil J, Coudreuse JM, Guyen N, et al. An algorithm to improve knee orthosis prescription for osteoarthritis patients. <i>Ann Phys Rehabil Med</i> . Sept 2016;59s:e156.	х					
Beckwée D, Vaes P, Cnudde M, Swinnen E, Bautmans I. Osteoarthritis of the knee: why does exercise work? A qualitative study of the literature. <i>Ageing Res Rev.</i> 2013;12(1):226-236. doi:10.1016/j.arr.2012.09.005.			х			
Bennell KL, Buchbinder R, Hinman RS. Physical therapies in the management of osteoarthritis: current state of the evidence. <i>Curr Opin Rheumatol</i> . 2015;27(3):304-311. doi:10.1097/BOR.000000000000160.				х		
Bennell KL, Hall M, Hinman RS. Osteoarthritis year in review 2015: rehabilitation and outcomes. <i>Osteoarthritis Cartilage</i> . 2016;24(1):58- 70. doi:10.1016/j.joca.2015.07.028.				Х		
Bennell KL, Hinman RS. A review of the clinical evidence for exercise in osteoarthritis of the hip and knee. <i>J Sci Med Sport</i> . 2011;14(1):4-9. doi:10.1016/j.jsams.2010.08.002.				Х		
Bertozzi L, Valdes K, Vanti C, Negrini S, Pillastrini P, Villafañe JH. Investigation of the effect of conservative interventions in thumb carpometacarpal osteoarthritis: systematic review and meta-analysis. <i>Disabil Rehabil</i> . 2015;37(22):2025-2043. doi:10.3109/09638288.2014.996299.				x		
Brand E, Nyland J, Henzman C, McGinnis M. Arthritis self-efficacy scale scores in knee osteoarthritis: a systematic review and meta-analysis comparing arthritis self-management education with or without exercise. J Orthop Sports Phys Ther. 2013;43(12):895-910. doi:10.2519/jospt.2013.4471.				X		

Citation	Outcome	Population	Study Design	Exposure	Not ideal fit for replacement of de novo search	Other
Brosseau L, Macleay L, Welch V, Tugwell P, Wells GA. WITHDRAWN: Intensity of exercise for the treatment of osteoarthritis. <i>Cochrane Database</i> <i>Syst Rev.</i> 2013;(2):Cd004259. doi:10.1002/14651858.CD004259.pub2			х			
Brosseau L, Wells GA, Pugh AG, et al. Ottawa Panel evidence-based clinical practice guidelines for therapeutic exercise in the management of hip osteoarthritis. <i>Clin Rehabil</i> . 2016;30(10):935-946. doi:10.1177/0269215515606198.			х			
Brosseau L, Wells GA, Tugwell P, et al. Ottawa Panel evidence-based clinical practice guidelines for the management of osteoarthritis in adults who are obese or overweight. <i>Phys Ther</i> . 2011;91(6):843-861. doi:10.2522/ptj.20100104.			Х			
Bruyere O, Cooper C, Pelletier JP, et al. An algorithm recommendation for the management of knee osteoarthritis in Europe and internationally: a report from a task force of the European Society for Clinical and Economic Aspects of Osteoporosis and Osteoarthritis (ESCEO). <i>Semin Arthritis</i> <i>Rheum</i> . 2014;44(3):253-263. doi:10.1016/j.semarthrit.2014.05.014.			х			
Bruyn GA, Naredo E, Damjanov N, et al. An OMERACT reliability exercise of inflammatory and structural abnormalities in patients with knee osteoarthritis using ultrasound assessment. <i>Ann Rheum Dis</i> . 2016;75(5):842-846. doi:10.1136/annrheumdis-2014- 206774.				x		
Button K, Roos PE, Spasić I, Adamson P, van Deursen RW. The clinical effectiveness of self-care interventions with an exercise component to manage knee conditions: a systematic review. <i>Knee</i> . 2015;22(5):360-371. doi:10.1016/j.knee.2015.05.003.				x		

Citation	Outcome	Population	Study Design	Exposure	Not ideal fit for replacement of de novo search	Other
Cattano NM, Driban JB, Cameron KL,						
Sitler MR. Impact of physical activity						
and mechanical loading on biomarkers						
typically used in osteoarthritis	v					
assessment: current concepts and	^					
knowledge gaps. Ther Adv						
Musculoskelet Dis. 2017;9(1):11-21.						
doi:10.1177/1759720X16670613.						
Chang WJ, Bennell KL, Hodges PW,						
Hinman RS, Liston MB, Schabrun SM.						
Combined exercise and transcranial						
direct current stimulation intervention			V			
for knee osteoarthritis: protocol for a			X			
pilot randomised controlled trial. BMJ						
<i>Open</i> . 2015;5(8):e008482.						
doi:10.1136/bmjopen-2015-008482.						
Chang WD, Chen S, Lee CL, Lin HY, Lai						
PT. The effects of tai chi chuan on						
improving mind-body health for knee						
osteoarthritis patients: a systematic	V					
review and meta-analysis. Evid Based	X					
Complement Alternat Med.						
2016:1813979.						
doi:10.1155/2016/1813979.						
Chapple CM, Nicholson H, Baxter GD,						
Abbott JH. Patient characteristics that						
predict progression of knee						
osteoarthritis: a systematic review of				х		
prognostic studies. Arthritis Care Res						
(Hoboken). 2011;63(8):1115-1125.						
doi:10.1002/acr.20492.						
Chen YW, Hunt MA, Campbell KL, Peill						
K. Reid WD. The effect of tai chi on four						
chronic conditions-cancer.						
osteoarthritis, heart failure and chronic						
obstructive pulmonary disease: a		Х				
systematic review and meta-analyses.						
Br J Sports Med. 2016:50(7):397-407.						
doi:10.1136/bjsports-2014-094388.						
Chen WH, Liu XX, Tong PJ, et al.						
Diagnosis and management of knee						
osteoarthritis: Chinese medicine expert						
consensus (2015). Chin J Intear Med.			Х			
2016:22(2):150-153.						
doi:10.1007/s11655-015-2432-7.						
Corbett MS, Rice SJ. Madurasinghe V. et						
al. Acupuncture and other physical						
treatments for the relief of pain due to						
osteoarthritis of the knee: network				х		
meta-analysis. Osteoarthritis Cartilage						
2013:21(9):1290-1298						
doi:10.1016/j.joca.2013.05.007.						

Citation	Outcome	Population	Study Design	Exposure	Not ideal fit for replacement of de novo search	Other
Coudeyre E, Jegu AG, Giustanini M, Marrel IP, Edouard P, Pereira B						
Isokinetic muscle strengthening for						
knee osteoarthritis: a systematic review						
of randomized controlled trials with				Х		
meta-analysis. Ann Phys Rehabil Med.						
2016;59(3):207-215.						
doi:10.1016/j.rehab.2016.01.013.						
Cramer H, Lauche R, Langhorst J, Dobos						
G. Yoga for rheumatic diseases: a						
systematic review. Rheumatology		х				
(Oxford). 2013;52(11):2025-2030.						
doi:10.1093/rheumatology/ket264.						
Davis AM. Osteoarthritis year in review:						
rehabilitation and outcomes.						
Osteoarthritis Cartilage.				Х		
2012;20(3):201-206.						
doi:10.1016/j.joca.2012.01.006.						
Davis AM, MacKay C. Osteoarthritis						
year in review: outcome of						
rehabilitation. Osteoarthritis Cartilage.				Х		
2013;21(10):1414-1424.						
doi:10.1016/j.joca.2013.08.013.						
de Rooij M, van der Leeden M,						
Heymans MW, et al. Course and						
predictors of pain and physical						
functioning in patients with hip	х					
osteoarthritis: systematic review and						
meta-analysis. J Kendbil Med.						
2010;48(3):245-252.						
dol.10.2340/10301977-2037.						
Houmans MW, at al. Prognosis of pain						
and physical functioning in patients						
with knee osteoarthritis: a systematic				×		
review and meta-analysis. Arthritis Care				~		
Res (Hoboken), 2016:68(4):481-492.						
doi:10.1002/acr.22693.						
Desveaux L, Beauchamp M, Goldstein R,						
Brooks D. Community-based exercise						
programs as a strategy to optimize						
function in chronic disease: a		х				
systematic review. Med Care.						
2014;52(3):216-226.						
doi:10.1097/MLR.000000000000065.						
Di Monaco M, Castiglioni C. Which type						
of exercise therapy is effective after hip						
arthroplasty? A systematic review of				x		
randomized controlled trials. Eur J Phys						
Rehabil Med. 2013;49(6):893-907, quiz						
921-923.						

Citation	Outcome	Population	Study Design	Exposure	Not ideal fit for replacement of de novo search	Other
Dobson F, Bennell KL, French SD, et al. Barriers and facilitators to exercise participation in people with hip and/or knee osteoarthritis: synthesis of the				×		
literature using behavior change theory. <i>Am J Phys Med Rehabil.</i> 2016;95(5):372-389. doi:10.1097/PHM.000000000000448.				X		
Duan-Porter W, Goldstein K, McDuffie J, et al. Mapping the evidence: sex effects in high-impact conditions for women veterans – Depression,						v
Diabetes, and Chronic Pain. VA Evidence-Based Synthesis Program Reports. Washington, DC: Department of Veterans Affairs: 2015						X
Duan-Porter W, Goldstein KM, McDuffie JR, et al. Reporting of sex effects by systematic reviews on interventions for depression, diabetes, and chronic pain. Ann Intern Med				х		
2016;165(3):184-193. doi:10.7326/M15-2877.						
A systematic review to evaluate exercise for anterior cruciate ligament injuries: does this approach reduce the incidence of knee osteoarthritis? <i>Open</i> <i>Access Rheumatol.</i> 2016;8:1-16. doi:10.2147/OARRR.S81673.		х				
Fernandes L, Hagen KB, Bijlsma JW, et al. EULAR recommendations for the non-pharmacological core management of hip and knee osteoarthritis. <i>Ann Rheum Dis</i> . 2013;72(7):1125-1135. doi:10.1136/annrheumdis-2012- 202745.			х			
Ferreira GE, Robinson CC, Wiebusch M, Viero CC, da Rosa LH, Silva MF. The effect of exercise therapy on knee adduction moment in individuals with knee osteoarthritis: a systematic review. <i>Clin Biomech (Bristol, Avon)</i> . 2015;30(6):521-527. doi:10.1016/j.clinbiomech.2015.03.028.	Х					
Field T. Knee osteoarthritis pain in the elderly can be reduced by massage therapy, yoga and tai chi: a review. <i>Complement Ther Clin Pract</i> . Feb 2016;22:87-92. doi:10.1016/j.ctcp.2016.01.001.				x		

Citation	Outcome	Population	Study Design	Exposure	Not ideal fit for replacement of de novo search	Other
Finney A, Healey E, Jordan JL, Ryan S, Dziedzic KS. Multidisciplinary approaches to managing osteoarthritis in multiple joint sites: a systematic review. <i>BMC Musculoskelet Disord</i> . July 2016;17:266. doi:10.1186/s12891-016- 1125-5.				Х		
Florez-García M, García-Pérez F, Curbelo R, et al. Efficacy and safety of home-based exercises versus individualized supervised outpatient physical therapy programs after total knee arthroplasty: a systematic review and meta-analysis. <i>Knee Surg Sports</i> <i>Traumatol Arthrosc.</i> July 2016. doi:10.1007/s00167-016-4231-x.				х	Х	
Fransen M, McConnell S, Harmer AR, Van der Esch M, Simic M, Bennell KL. Exercise for osteoarthritis of the knee. <i>Cochrane Database Syst Rev</i> . 2015;(1)CD004376. doi:10.1002/14651858.CD004376.pub3						x
Fransen M, McConnell S, Hernandez- Molina G, Reichenbach S. Exercise for osteoarthritis of the hip. <i>Cochrane</i> <i>Database Syst Rev.</i> 2014;(4):Cd007912. doi:10.1002/14651858.CD007912.pub2						x
Gaught AM, Carneiro KA. Evidence for determining the exercise prescription in patients with osteoarthritis. <i>Phys</i> <i>Sportsmed</i> . 2013;41(1):58-65. doi:10.3810/psm.2013.02.2000.			x			
Geneen LJ, Moore RA, Clarke C, Martin D, Colvin LA, Smith BH. Physical activity and exercise for chronic pain in adults: an overview of Cochrane Reviews. <i>Cochrane Database Syst Rev</i> . April 2017;1:CD011279. doi:10.1002/14651858.CD011279.pub3		х				
Golightly YM, Allen KD, Caine DJ. A comprehensive review of the effectiveness of different exercise programs for patients with osteoarthritis. <i>Phys Sportsmed</i> . 2012;40(4):52–65. doi:10.3810/psm.2012.11.1988.			х			

Citation	Outcome	Population	Study Design	Exposure	Not ideal fit for replacement of de novo search	Other
Gouttebarge V, Inklaar H, Frings-Dresen						
MH. Risk and consequences of						
osteoarthritis after a professional				x		
football career: a systematic review of				~		
the recent literature. J Sports Med Phys						
Fitness. 2014;54(4):494-504.						
Hagen KB, Dagfinrud H, Moe RH.						
Exercise therapy for bone and muscle						
health: an overview of systematic		Х				
reviews. BMC Med. Dec 2012;10:167.						
doi:10.1186/1741-7015-10-167.						
Hagen KB, Smedslund G, Østerås N,						
Jamtvedt G. Quality of community-						
based osteoarthritis care: a systematic				х		
review and meta-analysis. Arthritis Care				~		
Res (Hoboken). 2016;68(10):1443-1452.						
doi:10.1002/acr.22891.						
Hall A, Copsey B, Richmond H, et al.						
Effectiveness of tai chi for chronic						
musculoskeletal pain conditions:		x				
updated systematic review and meta-		~				
analysis. Phys Ther. 2016;97(2):227-						
238. doi:10.2522/ptj.20160246.						
Hawker GA, Mian S, Bednis K, Stanaitis						
I. Osteoarthritis year 2010 in review:						
non-pharmacologic therapy.			х			
Osteoarthritis Cartilage.						
2011;19(4):366-374.						
doi:10.1016/j.joca.2011.01.021.						
Henriksen M, Creaby MW, Lund H, Juhl						
C, Christensen R. Is there a causal link						
between knee loading and knee						
osteoarthritis progression? A				х		
systematic review and meta-analysis of						
cohort studies and randomised trials.						
BIVIJ Open. 2014;4(7):e005368.						
doi:10.1136/bmjopen-2014-005368.						
Henriksen M, Hansen JB, Klokker L,						
Bliddal H, Christensen R. Comparable						
effects of exercise and analgesics for						
pain secondary to knee osteoartinitis: a						Х
Cochrana systematic reviews / Comp						
Eff Poc. 2016;E(A):417, 421						
LJJ Nes. 2010,5(4).417-451.						
Hochborg MC Altman BD April KT of						
al American College of Phoumatelers						
al. American conege of Kneumatology						
nonpharmacologic and pharmacologic			v		v	
theranies in osteoarthritis of the hand			Λ		Λ	
hin and knee Arthritis Care Res						
(Hoboken). 2012;64(4):465-474.						

Citation	Outcome	Population	Study Design	Exposure	Not ideal fit for replacement of de novo search	Other
Hung CY, Hsiao MY, Chang KV, Han DS,						
Wang TG. Comparative effectiveness of						
dextrose prolotherapy versus control						
injections and exercise in the				x		
management of osteoarthritis pain: a				A		
systematic review and meta-analysis. J						
Pain Res. 2016;9:847-857.						
doi:10.2147/JPR.S118669.						
Iwamoto J, Sato Y, Takeda T,						
Matsumoto H. Effectiveness of exercise						
for osteoarthritis of the knee: a review			Х			
of the literature. World J Orthop.						
2011;2(5):37-42.						
dol:10.5312/wj0.v2.i5.37.						
Jackson KA, Givil-Jones S, Balt ME, et al.						
Assessing fisk factors for early hip						
pain: a Delphi study, BMI Open			Х			
2015:5(9):e007609						
doi:10.1136/bmiopen-2015-007609						
lansen ML Viechtbauer W. Lenssen AF						
Hendriks FL de Bie RA Strength						
training alone, exercise therapy alone.						
and exercise therapy with passive						
manual mobilisation each reduce pain						х
and disability in people with knee						
osteoarthritis: a systematic review. J						
Physiother. 2011;57(1):11–20.						
doi:10.1016/S1836-9553(11)70002-9.						
Jansons PS, Haines TP, O'Brien L.						
Interventions to achieve ongoing						
exercise adherence for adults with						
chronic health conditions who have	v				v	
completed a supervised exercise	^				^	
program: Systematic review and meta-						
analysis. Clin Rehabil. 2017;31(4):465-						
477. doi:10.1177/0269215516653995.						
Jaramillo A, Welch VA, Ueffing E, et al.						
Prevention and self-management						
interventions are top priorities for	х				Х	
osteoarthritis systematic reviews. J Clin						
<i>Epidemiol.</i> 2013;66(5):503-510.e4.						
doi:10.1016/J.Jclinepi.2012.06.01/.						
Jigami H, Sato D, Isubaki A, et al.						
there neutric every and forthightly						
therapeutic exercise on physical function and health related quality of						
life in individuals with his			Х			
osteoarthritis LOrthon Sci						
2012·17(6)·737-744						
doi:10.1007/s00776-012-0292-v.						

Citation	Outcome	Population	Study Design	Exposure	Not ideal fit for replacement of de novo search	Other
Jones BQ, Covey CJ, Sineath MH Jr.						
Nonsurgical management of knee pain			х			
in adults. Am Fam Physician.			X			
2015;92(10):875-883.						
Juhl C, Lund H, Roos EM, Zhang W,						
Christensen R. A hierarchy of patient-						
reported outcomes for meta-analysis of						
knee osteoarthritis trials: empirical	Х			Х		
evidence from a survey of high impact						
journals. Arthritis. 2012:136245.						
doi:10.1155/2012/136245.						
Kamioka H, Isutani K, Mutoh Y, et al. A						
systematic review of nonrandomized						
controlled trials on the curative effects		х				
of aquatic exercise. Int J Gen Med.						
March 2011;4:239-260.						
doi:10.2147/JJGM.S17384.						
Kan L, Zhang J, Yang Y, Wang P. The						
enects of yoga on pain, mobility, and						
quality of the in patients with knee						v
Based Complement Alternat Mad Sont						^
2010.0010552. doi:10.1155/2016/6016522						
Kang IW Lee MS Posadzki P Ernst F						
T'ai chi for the treatment of						
osteoarthritis: a systematic review and						
meta-analysis BMI Open						Х
2011:1(1):e000035						
doi:10.1136/bmiopen-2010-000035						
Kelley GA, Kelley KS, Hootman JM.						
Jones DL. Effects of community-						
deliverable exercise on pain and						
physical function in adults with arthritis						
and other rheumatic diseases: a meta-		х				
analysis. Arthritis Care Res (Hoboken).						
2011;63(1):79-93.						
doi:10.1002/acr.20347.						
Kelley GA, Kelley KS, Hootman JM.						
Effects of exercise on depression in						
adults with arthritis: a systematic						
review with meta-analysis of	Х					
randomized controlled trials. Arthritis						
Res Ther. Feb 2015;17:21.						
doi:10.1186/s13075-015-0533-5.						
Kelley GA, Kelley KS. Effects of exercise						
on depressive symptoms in adults with						
arthritis and other rheumatic disease: a						
systematic review of meta-analyses.						Х
BMC Musculoskelet Disord. April						
2014;15:121. doi:10.1186/1471-2474-						
15-121.						

Citation	Outcome	Population	Study Design	Exposure	Not ideal fit for replacement of de novo search	Other
Kelley GA, Kelley KS. Exercise reduces						
depressive symptoms in adults with						
arthritis: evidential value. World J		Х				
Rheumatol. 2016;6(2):23-29.						
doi:10.5499/WJR.v6.i2.23.						
Keysor JJ, Brembs A. Exercise: necessary						
but not sufficient for improving						
function and preventing disability? Curr		Х				
Opin Rheumatol. 2011;23(2):211-218.						
doi:10.1097/BOR.0b013e3283432c41.						
Khalaj N, Abu Osman NA, Mokhtar AH,						
et al. Effect of exercise and gait						
retraining on knee adduction moment	v					
in people with knee osteoarthritis. Proc	~					
Inst Mech Eng H. 2014;228(2):190-199.						
doi:10.1177/0954411914521155.						
Khoja SS, Susko AM, Josbeno DA, Piva						
SR, Fitzgerald GK. Comparing physical						
activity programs for managing			Y			
osteoarthritis in overweight or obese			~			
patients. J Comp Eff Res. 2014;3(3):283-						
299. doi:10.2217/cer.14.15.						
Kirkendall DT, Garrett WE Jr.						
Management of the retired athlete with						
osteoarthritis of the knee. Cartilage.				Х		
2012;3(suppl 1):69s-76s.						
doi:10.1177/1947603511408287.						
Kjeken I, Grotle M, Hagen KB, Østerås						
N. Development of an evidence-based						
exercise programme for people with			v			
hand osteoarthritis. Scand J Occup Ther.			^			
2015;22(2):103-116.						
doi:10.3109/11038128.2014.941394.						
Kjeken I. Occupational therapy-based						
and evidence-supported						
recommendations for assessment and			x			
exercises in hand osteoarthritis. Scand J			X			
Occup Ther. 2011;18(4):265-281.						
doi:10.3109/11038128.2010.514942.						
Kjeken I, Smedslund G, Moe RH,						
Slatkowsky-Christensen B, Uhlig T,						
Hagen KB. Systematic review of design						
and effects of splints and exercise				x		
programs in hand osteoarthritis.						
Arthritis Care Res (Hoboken).						
2011;63(6):834-848.						
doi:10.1002/acr.20427.						
Kong LJ, Lauche R, Klose P, et al. Tai chi						
for chronic pain conditions: a						
systematic review and meta-analysis of						х
randomized controlled trials. Sci Rep.						~
April 2016;6:25325.						
doi:10.1038/srep25325.						

Citation	Outcome	Population	Study Design	Exposure	Not ideal fit for replacement of de novo search	Other
Krauss I, Steinhilber B, Haupt G, Miller						
R, Grau S, Janssen P. Efficacy of						
conservative treatment regimes for hip						
osteoarthritisevaluation of the						
therapeutic exercise regime "Hip			Х			
School": a protocol for a randomised,						
controlled trial. BMC Musculoskelet						
Disord. Nov 2011;12:270.						
doi:10.1186/14/1-24/4-12-2/0.						
Kristensen J, Franklyn-Willer A.						
Resistance training in musculoskeletal		v				
renabilitation: a systematic review. Br J		X				
Sports Med. 2012;40(10):719-720.						
Kroop ED van der Burg LB, Buchhinder						
Ribbin FP, Vali del Burg LR, Buchbinder						
Solf management education						
programmes for osteoarthritis						
Cochrane Database Syst Rev				Х		
$2014 \cdot (1) \cdot CD008963$						
doi:10.1002/1/651858 CD008963 pub2						
Larmer PJ, Reay ND, Aubert ER, Kersten						
P. Systematic review of guidelines for						
the physical management of			v			
osteoarthritis. Arch Phys Med Rehabil.			X			
2014;95(2):375-389.						
doi:10.1016/j.apmr.2013.10.011.						
Lauche R, Langhorst J, Dobos G, Cramer						
H. A systematic review and meta-						
analysis of tai chi for osteoarthritis of						x
the knee. Complement Ther Med.						~
2013;21(4):396-406.						
doi:10.1016/j.ctim.2013.06.001.						
Lee MS, Ernst E. Systematic reviews of						
t'ai chi: an overview. Br J Sports Med.			Х			
2012;46(10):/13-/18.						
doi:10.1136/bjsm.2010.080622.						
Lefevre-Colau MINI, Nguyen C, Haddad						
R, et al. is physical activity, practiced as						
fector for esteparthritic Ann Phys	х		Х		Х	
Robabil Mod 2016:E0(2):106 206						
doi:10.1016/i rebab 2016.02.007						
Li CS Aveni OR Sprague S Truong V						
Bhandari M. Conservative treatments						
surgical treatments and the						
KineSpring® Knee Implant system for				Y		
knee osteoarthritis: a systematic				^		
review 11 ong Term Fff Med Implants						
2013;23(2-3):105-149.						

Citation	Outcome	Population	Study Design	Exposure	Not ideal fit for replacement of de novo search	Other
Li X, Wang XQ, Chen BL, Huang LY, Liu Y.						
Erratum to "Whole-body vibration						
exercise for knee osteoarthritis: a						
systematic review and meta-analysis".				Х		
Evid Based Complement Alternat Med.						
Nov 2015:636435.						
doi:10.1155/2015/636435.						
Li X, Wang XQ, Chen BL, Huang LY, Liu Y.						
Whole-body vibration exercise for knee						
osteoarthritis: a systematic review and				v		
meta-analysis. Evid Based Complement				^		
Alternat Med. Aug 2015:758147.						
doi:10.1155/2015/758147.						
Lim AY, Doherty M. What of guidelines						
for osteoarthritis? Int J Rheum Dis.			v			
2011;14(2):136-144.			X			
doi:10.1111/j.1756-185X.2011.01609.x.						
Li Y, Su Y, Chen S, et al. The effects of						
resistance exercise in patients with						
knee osteoarthritis: a systematic review						v
and meta-analysis. Clin Rehabil.						х
2016;30(10):947–959.						
doi:10.1177/0269215515610039.						
Loew L, Brosseau L, Wells GA, et al.						
Ottawa panel evidence-based clinical						
practice guidelines for aerobic walking						
programs in the management of			х			
osteoarthritis. Arch Phys Med Rehabil.						
2012;93(7):1269-1285.						
doi:10.1016/j.apmr.2012.01.024.						
Lowe CJ, Davies L, Sackley CM, Barker						
KL. Effectiveness of land-based						
physiotherapy exercise following						
hospital discharge following hip				v		
arthroplasty for osteoarthritis: an				^		
updated systematic review.						
Physiotherapy. 2015;101(3):252-265.						
doi:10.1016/j.physio.2014.12.003.						
Lu M, Su Y, Zhang Y, et al. Effectiveness						
of aquatic exercise for treatment of						
knee osteoarthritis: systematic review						v
and meta-analysis. Z Rheumatol.						^
2015;74(6):543-552.						
doi:10.1007/s00393-014-1559-9.						
Maly MR, Robbins SM. Osteoarthritis						
year in review 2014: rehabilitation and						
outcomes. Osteoarthritis Cartilage.				Х		
2014;22(12):1958-1988.						
doi:10.1016/j.joca.2014.08.011.						

Citation	Outcome	Population	Study Design	Exposure	Not ideal fit for replacement of de novo search	Other
Mat S, Tan MP, Kamaruzzaman SB, Ng						
balance and reducing falls rick in						
osteoarthritis of the knee: a systematic				Х		
review Age Ageing 2015:44(1):16-24						
doi:10.1093/ageing/afu112						
Mattos F. Leite N. Pitta A. Bento PC.						
Effects of aquatic exercise on muscle						
strength and functional performance of						
individuals with osteoarthritis: a				х		
systematic review. Rev Bras Reumatol						
Engl Ed. 2016;56(6):530-542.						
doi:10.1016/j.rbre.2016.09.003.						
McAlindon TE, Bannuru RR, Sullivan						
MC, et al. OARSI guidelines for the non-						
surgical management of knee			v			
osteoarthritis. Osteoarthritis Cartilage.			^			
2014;22(3):363-388.						
doi:10.1016/j.joca.2014.01.003.						
McWilliams DF, Leeb BF, Muthuri SG,						
Doherty M, Zhang W. Occupational risk						
factors for osteoarthritis of the knee: a		х				
meta-analysis. Osteoarthritis Cartilage.						
2011;19(7):829-839.						
doi:10.1016/j.joca.2011.02.016.						
Meneses SR, Goode AP, Nelson AE, et						
al. Clinical algorithms to ald						
Osteoarthritis Gartilago				Х		
2016·24/0)·1487-1499						
doi:10.1016/i joca 2016.04.004						
Mills K. Hunt MA. Leigh R. Ferber R. A						
systematic review and meta-analysis of						
lower limb neuromuscular alterations						
associated with knee osteoarthritis				х		
during level walking. Clin Biomech						
(Bristol, Avon). 2013;28(7):713-724.						
doi:10.1016/j.clinbiomech.2013.07.008.						
Monticone M, Frizziero A, Rovere G, et						
al. Hyaluronic acid intra-articular						
injection and exercise therapy: effects						
on pain and disability in subjects						
affected by lower limb joints				Х		
osteoarthritis. A systematic review by						
the Italian Society of Physical and						
Renabilitation Medicine (SIMFER). Eur J						
Mover DE Detressurer A Deise 5						
IVIOYER KF, KATNESWARAN A, BEIER F,						
pinningnam TB. Osteoarthritis year in						
clinical studies in estacarthritic				v		
Osteoarthritis Cartilage				^		
2014:22(12):1989-2002						
doi:10.1016/j.joca.2014.06.034.						

Citation	Outcome	Population	Study Design	Exposure	Not ideal fit for replacement of de novo search	Other
Nahin RL, Boineau R, Khalsa PS,						
Stussman BJ, Weber WJ. Evidence-						
based evaluation of complementary						
health approaches for pain			Х			
management in the United States.						
Mayo Clin Proc. 2016;91(9):1292-1306.						
doi:10.1016/j.mayocp.2016.06.007.						
Nelson AE, Allen KD, Golightly YM,						
Goode AP, Jordan JM. A systematic						
review of recommendations and						
guidelines for the management of						
osteoarthritis: the chronic	х					
osteoarthritis management initiative of						
the U.S. bone and joint initiative. Semin						
Arthritis Rheum. 2014;43(6):701-712.						
doi:10.1016/j.semarthrit.2013.11.012.						
Nguyen C, Lefèvre-Colau MM,						
Poiraudeau S, Rannou F. Rehabilitation						
(exercise and strength training) and						
osteoarthritis: a critical narrative			х			
review. Ann Phys Rehabil Med.						
2016;59(3):190-195.						
doi:10.1016/j.rehab.2016.02.010.						
Nicolson PJA, Bennell KL, Dobson FL.						
Van Ginckel A. Holden MA. Hinman RS.						
Interventions to increase adherence to						
therapeutic exercise in older adults						
with low back pain and/or hip/knee	х					
osteoarthritis: a systematic review and						
meta-analysis. Br J Sports Med.						
2017:51(10):791-799.						
doi:10.1136/bisports-2016-096458						
O'Connor SB. Tully MA. Ryan B. et al.						
Walking exercise for chronic						
musculoskeletal pain: systematic						
review and meta-analysis. Arch Phys		Х				
Med Rehabil 2015:96(4):724-734 e3						
doi:10.1016/i.apmr.2014.12.003.						
Oliveira CB. Franco MB. Maher CG. et						
al Physical activity interventions for						
increasing objectively measured						
physical activity levels in patients with						
chronic musculoskeletal nain: a	Х				Х	
systematic review. Arthritis Care Res						
(Hoboken), 2016:68(12):1832-1842						
doi:10.1002/acr 22919						
Østerås N Kjeken Smedslund G et al						
Exercise for hand osteoarthritis						
Cochrane Database Syst Rev Jan						
2017:1:Cd010388		Х				
doi:10.1002/14651858 CD010388 pub?						

Citation	Outcome	Population	Study Design	Exposure	Not ideal fit for replacement of de novo search	Other
Papavasiliou KA, Kenanidis E, Potoupnis ME, Kapetanou A, Sayegh FE. Participation in athletic activities may be associated with later development of hip and knee osteoarthritis. <i>Phys</i> <i>Sportsmed</i> . 2011;39(4):51-59. doi:10.3810/psm.2011.11.1939.			x			
Pedersen BK, Saltin B. Exercise as medicine—evidence for prescribing exercise as therapy in 26 different chronic diseases. <i>Scand J Med Sci</i> <i>Sports</i> . 2015;25(suppl 3):1-72. doi:10.1111/sms.12581.		x				
Porcheret M, Grime J, Main C, Dziedzic K. Developing a model osteoarthritis consultation: a Delphi consensus exercise. <i>BMC Musculoskelet Disord</i> . Jan 2013;14:25. doi:10.1186/1471- 2474-14-25.			X			
Pozzi F, Snyder-Mackler L, Zeni J. Physical exercise after knee arthroplasty: a systematic review of controlled trials. <i>Eur J Phys Rehabil</i> <i>Med.</i> 2013;49(6):877-892.				x	х	
Physical exercise and weight loss for hip and knee osteoarthritis in very old patients: a systematic review of the literature. <i>Open Rheumatol J.</i> 2014;8:89-95. doi:10.2174/1874312901408010089.				x		
Regnaux JP, Lefevre-Colau MM, Trinquart L, et al. High-intensity versus low-intensity physical activity or exercise in people with hip or knee osteoarthritis. <i>Cochrane Database Syst</i> <i>Rev.</i> 2015;(10):Cd010203. doi:10.1002/14651858.CD010203.pub2				х		
Richmond SA, Fukuchi RK, Ezzat A, Schneider K, Schneider G, Emery CA. Are joint injury, sport activity, physical activity, obesity, or occupational activities predictors for osteoarthritis? A systematic review. <i>J Orthop Sports</i> <i>Phys Ther</i> . 2013;43(8):515-B19. doi:10.2519/jospt.2013.4796.				x		
Ringdahl E, Pandit S. Treatment of knee osteoarthritis. <i>Am Fam Physician</i> . 2011;83(11):1287-1292.			х			

Citation	Outcome	Population	Study Design	Exposure	Not ideal fit for replacement of de novo search	Other
Romeo A, Parazza S, Boschi M, Nava T,						
Vanti C. Manual therapy and						
therapeutic exercise in the treatment of						v
osteoarthritis of the hip: a systematic						^
review. Reumatismo. 2013;65(2):63-74.						
doi:10.4081/reumatismo.2013.63.						
Roos EM, Juhl CB. Osteoarthritis 2012						
year in review: rehabilitation and						
outcomes. Osteoarthritis Cartilage.				х		
2012;20(12):1477-1483.						
doi:10.1016/j.joca.2012.08.028.						
Runhaar J, Luijsterburg P, Dekker J,						
Bierma-Zeinstra SM. Identifying						
potential working mechanisms behind						
the positive effects of exercise therapy	N.					
on pain and function in osteoarthritis; a	X					
systematic review. Osteoarthritis						
Cartilage. 2015;23(7):1071-1082.						
doi:10.1016/j.joca.2014.12.027.						
Sampath KK, Mani R, Miyamori T,						
Tumilty S. The effects of manual						
therapy or exercise therapy or both in						
people with hip osteoarthritis: a						Х
systematic review and meta-analysis.						
Clin Rehabil. 2016;30(12):1141–1155.						
doi:10.1177/0269215515622670.						
Sharma M. Yoga as an alternative and						
complementary approach for arthritis:						
a systematic review. J Evid Based						v
Complementary Altern Med.						^
2014;19(1):51-58.						
doi:10.1177/2156587213499918.						
Shengelia R, Parker SJ, Ballin M, George						
T, Reid MC. Complementary therapies						
for osteoarthritis: are they effective?						Х
Pain Manag Nurs. 2013;14(4):e274-						
e288. doi:10.1016/j.pmn.2012.01.001.						
Silva A, Serrão PR, Driusso P, Mattiello						
SM. The effects of therapeutic exercise						
on the balance of women with knee	х					
osteoarthritis: a systematic review. Rev						
Bras Fisioter. 2012;16(1):1-9.						
Sliepen M, Brandes M, Rosenbaum D.						
Current physical activity monitors in hip						
and knee osteoarthritis – A review.				Х		
Arthritis Care Res (Hoboken). Dec 2016.						
doi:10.1002/acr.23170.						
Smith TO, King JJ, Hing CB. The						
effectiveness of proprioceptive-based						
exercise for osteoarthritis of the knee: a				х		
systematic review and meta-analysis.						
Rheumatol Int. 2012;32(11):3339-3351.						
doi:10.1007/s00296-012-2480-7.						

Citation	Outcome	Population	Study Design	Exposure	Not ideal fit for replacement of de novo search	Other
Smith T, Kirby E, Davies L. A systematic review to determine the optimal type and dosage of land-based exercises for treating knee osteoarthritis. <i>Physical</i> <i>Therapy Reviews</i> . 2014;19(2):105-113. doi:10.1179/1743288X13Y.0000000108						х
Solloway MR, Taylor SL, Shekelle PG, et al. An evidence map of the effect of tai chi on health outcomes. <i>Syst Rev.</i> 2016;5(1):126. doi:10.1186/s13643- 016-0300-y.		Х				
Stubbs B, Hurley M, Smith T. What are the factors that influence physical activity participation in adults with knee and hip osteoarthritis? A systematic review of physical activity correlates. <i>Clin Rehabil.</i> 2015;29(1):80-94. doi:10.1177/0269215514538069.	х				х	
Tanaka R, Ozawa J, Kito N, Moriyama H. Does exercise therapy improve the health-related quality of life of people with knee osteoarthritis? A systematic review and meta-analysis of randomized controlled trials. <i>J Phys</i> <i>Ther Sci.</i> 2015;27(10):3309–3314. doi:10.1589/jpts.27.3309.						х
Tanaka R, Ozawa J, Kito N, Moriyama H. Effect of the frequency and duration of land-based therapeutic exercise on pain relief for people with knee osteoarthritis: a systematic review and meta-analysis of randomized controlled trials. J Phys Ther Sci. 2014;26(7):969– 975.						х
Tanaka R, Ozawa J, Kito N, Moriyama H. Effects of exercise therapy on walking ability in individuals with knee osteoarthritis: a systematic review and meta-analysis of randomised controlled trials. <i>Clin Rehabil.</i> 2016;30(1):36-52. doi:10.1177/0269215515570098.	х					
Tanaka R, Ozawa J, Kito N, Moriyama H. Efficacy of strengthening or aerobic exercise on pain relief in people with knee osteoarthritis: a systematic review and meta-analysis of randomized controlled trials. <i>Clin Rehabil</i> . 2013;27(12):1059–1071. doi:10.1177/0269215513488898.						x

Citation	Outcome	Population	Study Design	Exposure	Not ideal fit for replacement of de novo search	Other
Tanaka R, Ozawa J, Kito N, Yamasaki T,						
Moriyama H. Evidence of improvement						
in various impairments by exercise						
interventions in patients with knee						
osteoarthritis: a systematic review and	Х					
meta-analysis of randomized clinical						
trials. J Jpn Phys Ther Assoc.						
2013;16(1):7-21.						
doi:10.1298/jjpta.Vol16_003.						
Thorstensson CA, Garellick G, Rystedt						
H, Dahlberg LE. Better management of						
patients with osteoarthritis:						
development and nationwide						
implementation of an evidence-based			Х			
supported osteoarthritis self-						
management programme.						
Musculoskeletal Care. 2015;13(2):67-						
75. doi:10.1002/msc.1085.						
Uthman OA, van der Windt DA, Jordan						
JL, et al. Exercise for lower limb						
osteoarthritis: systematic review						
incorporating trial sequential analysis						Х
and network meta-analysis. BMJ. Sept						
2013;347:f5555.						
doi:10.1136/bmj.f5555.						
Urquhart DM, Tobing JF, Hanna FS, et						
al. What is the effect of physical activity						
on the knee joint? A systematic review.						х
Med Sci Sports Exerc. 2011;43(3):432-						
442.						
doi:10.1249/MSS.0b013e3181et5bt8.						
Veenhof C, Huisman PA, Barten JA,						
Takken T, Pisters MF. Factors						
associated with physical activity in	N.					
patients with osteoarthritis of the hip	х					
or knee: a systematic review.						
<i>Osteoartnritis Cartilage</i> . 2012;20(1):6-						
12. doi:10.1016/J.joca.2011.10.006.						
Zeinstra SIVI. Aquatic exercise &						
conditions Bost Brast Bos Clin			х			
Bhoumatol 2012;26(2):22E 242						
Anieumaton. 2012;20(3):333-343.						
Waller B. Ogonowska Sladownik A						
Vitor M at al Effect of therapoutic						
aquatic exercise on symptoms and						
function associated with lower limb						
osteoarthritis: systematic roviow with						Х
meta-analysis Phys Ther						
2011/9/(10)·1383-1305						
doi:10.2522/ptj.20130417.						

Citation	Outcome	Population	Study Design	Exposure	Not ideal fit for replacement of de novo search	Other
Wallis JA, Taylor NF. Pre-operative						
niterventions (non-surgical and non-						
pharmacological) for patients with hip						
roplacement surgery—a systematic		v				
replacement surgery—a systematic		^				
Ostooarthritic Cartilago						
2011.10(12).1381_1305						
doi:10.1016/i.joca.2011.09.001						
Wallis IA Webster KE Levinger P						
Taylor NF. What proportion of people						
with hin and knee osteoarthritis meet						
nhysical activity guidelines? A						
systematic review and meta-analysis	Х				Х	
Asteoarthritis Cartilage						
2013.21(11).1648-1659						
doi:10.1016/i.ioca.2013.08.003.						
Wang P. Yang X. Yang Y. et al. Effects of						
whole body vibration on pain stiffness						
and physical functions in patients with						
knee osteoarthritis: a systematic review				x		
and meta-analysis <i>Clin Rehabil</i>				X		
2015:29(10):939-951.						
doi:10.1177/0269215514564895.						
Ward L Stephings S Cherkin D Baxter						
GD. Components and reporting of voga						
interventions for musculoskeletal						
conditions: a systematic review of						
randomised controlled trials.	Х					
Complement Ther Med.						
2014;22(5):909-919.						
doi:10.1016/j.ctim.2014.08.007.						
Ward L, Stebbings S, Cherkin D, Baxter						
GD. Yoga for functional ability, pain and						
psychosocial outcomes in						
musculoskeletal conditions: a				х		
systematic review and meta-analysis.						
Musculoskeletal Care. 2013;11(4):203-						
217. doi:10.1002/msc.1042.						
Williamson W, Kluzek S, Roberts N, et						
al. Behavioural physical activity						
interventions in participants with						
lower-limb osteoarthritis: a systematic	Х				Х	
review with meta-analysis. BMJ Open.						
2015;5(8):e007642.						
doi:10.1136/bmjopen-2015-007642.						
Witjes S, Gouttebarge V, Kuijer PP, van						
Geenen RC, Poolman RW, Kerkhoffs						
GM. Return to sports and physical						
activity after total and unicondylar knee	x			x		
arthroplasty: a systematic review and	~			~		
meta-analysis. Sports Med.						
2016;46(2):269-292.						
doi:10.1007/s40279-015-0421-9.						

Citation	Outcome	Population	Study Design	Exposure	Not ideal fit for replacement of de novo search	Other
Witteveen AG, Hofstad CJ, Kerkhoffs GM. Hyaluronic acid and other conservative treatment options for osteoarthritis of the ankle. <i>Cochrane</i> <i>Database Syst Rev</i> . Oct 2015;(10):Cd010643. doi:10.1002/14651858.CD010643.pub2		х				
Wood LR, Peat GM, Mullis R, Thomas E, Foster NE. Impairment-targeted exercises for older adults with knee pain: protocol for a proof-of-principle study. <i>BMC Musculoskelet Disord</i> . Jan 2011;12:2. doi:10.1186/1471-2474-12- 2.			x			
Yan JH, Gu WJ, Sun J, Zhang WX, Li BW, Pan L. Efficacy of tai chi on pain, stiffness and function in patients with osteoarthritis: a meta-analysis. <i>PLoS</i> <i>One</i> . 2013;8(4):e61672. doi:10.1371/journal.pone.0061672.						х
Yang GY, Wang LQ, Ren J, et al. Evidence base of clinical studies on Tai Chi: a bibliometric analysis. <i>PLoS One</i> . 2015;10(3):e0120655. doi:10.1371/journal.pone.0120655.		х				
Ye J, Cai S, Zhong W, Cai S, Zheng Q. Effects of tai chi for patients with knee osteoarthritis: a systematic review. J Phys Ther Sci. 2014;26(7):1133-1137. doi:10.1589/jpts.26.1133.						х
Ye L, Kalichman L, Spittle A, Dobson F, Bennell K. Effects of rehabilitative interventions on pain, function and physical impairments in people with hand osteoarthritis: a systematic review. <i>Arthritis Res Ther</i> . 2011;13(1):R28. doi:10.1186/ar3254.		х				
Zacharias A, Green RA, Semciw AI, Kingsley MI, Pizzari T. Efficacy of rehabilitation programs for improving muscle strength in people with hip or knee osteoarthritis: a systematic review with meta-analysis. <i>Osteoarthritis</i> <i>Cartilage</i> . 2014;22(11):1752-1773. doi:10.1016/j.joca.2014.07.005.	x					
Zafar H, Alghadir A, Anwer S, Al-Eisa E. Therapeutic effects of whole-body vibration training in knee osteoarthritis: a systematic review and meta-analysis. <i>Arch Phys Med Rehabil</i> . 2015;96(8):1525-1532. doi:10.1016/j.apmr.2015.03.010.				x		

Citation	Outcome	Population	Study Design	Exposure	Not ideal fit for replacement of de novo search	Other
Zhang Y, Huang L, Su Y, Zhan Z, Li Y, Lai X. The effects of traditional Chinese exercise in treating knee osteoarthritis: a systematic review and meta-analysis. <i>PLoS One</i> . 2017;12(1):e0170237. doi:10.1371/journal.pone.0170237.						х

Rationale for Exclusion at Abstract or Full-Text Triage for Original Research

The table below lists the excluded articles with at least one reason for exclusion, but may not reflect all possible reasons.

Citation	Outcome	Population	Study Design	Exposure	Other
Ageberg E, Engström G, Gerhardsson de Verdier M, Rollof J, Roos EM, Lohmander LS. Effect of leisure time physical activity on severe knee or hip osteoarthritis leading to total joint replacement: a population-based prospective cohort study. <i>BMC</i> <i>Musculoskelet Disord</i> . May 2012;13:73. doi:10.1186/1471-2474-13-73.		х			
Ageberg E, Link A, Roos EM. Feasibility of neuromuscular training in patients with severe hip or knee OA: the individualized goal-based NEMEX- TJR training program. <i>BMC Musculoskelet Disord</i> . June 2010;11:126. doi:10.1186/1471-2474-11-126.	х				
Ageberg E, Nilsdotter A, Kosek E, Roos EM. Effects of neuromuscular training (NEMEX-TJR) on patient- reported outcomes and physical function in severe primary hip or knee osteoarthritis: a controlled before-and-after study. <i>BMC Musculoskelet Disord</i> . Aug 2013;14:232. doi:10.1186/1471-2474-14-232.				х	
Aguiar GC, Do Nascimento MR, De Miranda AS, Rocha NP, Teixeira AL, Scalzo PL. Effects of an exercise therapy protocol on inflammatory markers, perception of pain, and physical performance in individuals with knee osteoarthritis. <i>Rheumatol Int.</i> 2015;35(3):525-531. doi:10.1007/s00296-014-3148- 2.			х		
Bennell KL, Hunt MA, Wrigley TV, et al. Hip strengthening reduces symptoms but not knee load in people with medial knee osteoarthritis and varus malalignment: a randomised controlled trial. <i>Osteoarthritis Cartilage</i> . 2010;18(5):621-628. doi:10.1016/j.joca.2010.01.010.					х
Bennell KL, Wrigley T, Kyriakides M, et al. Comparison of neuromuscular and quadriceps strengthening exercise in people with medial knee osteoarthritis and varus malalignment: randomised controlled trial. <i>Osteoarthritis Cartilage</i> . 2013;21:S273-S274. doi:10.1016/j.joca.2013.02.573.	х				

Citation	Outcome	Population	Study Design	Exposure	Other
Bennell KL, Kyriakides M, Metcalf B, et al. Neuromuscular versus quadriceps strengthening exercise in patients with medial knee osteoarthritis and varus malalignment: a randomized controlled trial. <i>Arthritis Rheumatol.</i> 2014;66(4):950-959. doi:10.1002/art.38317.	x				
Brakke R, Singh J, Sullivan W. Physical therapy in persons with osteoarthritis. <i>PM R</i> . 2012;4(suppl 5):S53-S58. doi:10.1016/j.pmrj.2012.02.017.			х		
Braun B, Parker D, Harvey L, Bissen J, Melko C, Xi M. Arthritis-friendly adaptations for weight management and physical activity promotion: two 12-month interventions. 134th Annual Meeting & Exposition; Nov 4 2006; Boston, MA. American Public Health Association; 2006.	х				
Burstein D. Tracking longitudinal changes in knee degeneration and repair. <i>J Bone Joint Surg Am</i> . 2009;91(suppl 1):51-53. doi:10.2106/JBJS.H.01412.				х	
Chakravarty EF, Hubert HB, Lingala VB, Zatarain E, Fries JF. Long distance running and knee osteoarthritis. A prospective study. <i>Am J Prev Med</i> . 2008;35(2):133-138. doi:10.1016/j.amepre.2008.03.032.		Х			
Ciolac EG, Greve JM. Muscle strength and exercise intensity adaptation to resistance training in older women with knee osteoarthritis and total knee arthroplasty. <i>Clinics (Sao Paulo)</i> . 2011;66(12):2079- 2084.			х		
Constantinou M, Loureiro A, Carty C, Mills P, Barrett R. Hip joint mechanics during walking in individuals with mild-to-moderate hip osteoarthritis. <i>Gait</i> <i>Posture</i> . March 2017;53:162-167. doi:10.1016/j.gaitpost.2017.01.017.				х	
Desmeules F, Dionne CE, Belzile E, Bourbonnais R, Frémont P. Waiting for total knee replacement surgery: factors associated with pain, stiffness, function and quality of life. <i>BMC Musculoskelet</i> <i>Disord</i> . May 2009;10:52. doi:10.1186/1471-2474- 10-52.				х	
Dunlop D. How lifestyle factors influence the development and progression of OA. <i>Osteoarthritis Cartilage</i> . 2014;22:S3-S4. doi:10.1016/j.joca.2014.02.023.			Х		
Dunlop DD, Semanik P, Song J, et al. Moving to maintain function in knee osteoarthritis: evidence from the osteoarthritis initiative. <i>Arch Phys Med</i> <i>Rehabil</i> . 2010;91(5):714-721. doi:10.1016/j.apmr.2010.01.015.	х				
Dunlop DD, Song J, Semanik PA, et al. Objective physical activity measurement in the osteoarthritis initiative: are guidelines being met? <i>Arthritis Rheum.</i> 2011;63(11):3372-3382. doi:10.1002/art.30562.			х		

Citation	Outcome	Population	Study Design	Exposure	Other
Dunlop DD, Song J, Semanik PA, et al. Relation of physical activity time to incident disability in community dwelling adults with or at risk of knee arthritis: prospective cohort study. <i>BMJ</i> . April 2014;348:g2472. doi:10.1136/bmj.g2472.	Х				
Durmus D, Alayli G, Bayrak IK, Canturk F. Assessment of the effect of glucosamine sulfate and exercise on knee cartilage using magnetic resonance imaging in patients with knee osteoarthritis: a randomized controlled clinical trial. <i>J Back</i> <i>Musculoskelet Rehabil</i> . 2012;25(4):275-284. doi:10.3233/BMR-2012-0336.			х		
Feinglass J, Song J, Semanik P, et al. Association of functional status with changes in physical activity: insights from a behavioral intervention for participants with arthritis. <i>Arch Phys Med Rehabil</i> . 2012;93(1):172-175. doi:10.1016/j.apmr.2011.06.037.				x	
Felson D, Niu J, Sack B, Aliabadi P, McCullough C, Nevitt MC. Progression of osteoarthritis as a state of inertia. <i>Ann Rheum Dis</i> . 2013;72(6):924-929. doi:10.1136/annrheumdis-2012-201575.				х	
Hirata S, Ono R, Yamada M, et al. Ambulatory physical activity, disease severity, and employment status in adult women with osteoarthritis of the hip. <i>J Rheumatol</i> . 2006;33(5):939-945.				х	
Holsgaard-Larsen A, Clausen B, Sondergaard J, Christensen R, Andriacchi TP, Roos E. The effect on knee-joint load of instruction in analgesic use compared with neuromuscular exercise in patients with early knee osteoarthritis—a randomized, single-blind, controlled trial. <i>Osteoarthritis</i> <i>Cartilage</i> . April 2016;24:S497-S498. doi:10.1016/j.joca.2016.01.912.					Х
Hoogeboom TJ, den Broeder AA, de Bie RA, van den Ende CH. Longitudinal impact of joint pain comorbidity on quality of life and activity levels in knee osteoarthritis: data from the Osteoarthritis Initiative. <i>Rheumatology (Oxford)</i> . 2013;52(3):543- 546. doi:10.1093/rheumatology/kes314.				х	
Hunt MA, Pollock CL, Kraus VB, et al. Biomarkers of cartilage degradation and synthesis relevant to knee osteoarthritis: relationships with dynamic knee joint load and changes following exercise. <i>Osteoarthritis</i> <i>Cartilage</i> . April 2012;20:S83-S84. doi:10.1016/j.joca.2012.02.076.					х
Hunter DJ, Beavers DP, Eckstein F, et al. The Intensive Diet and Exercise for Arthritis (IDEA) trial: 18-month radiographic and MRI outcomes. <i>Osteoarthritis Cartilage</i> . 2015;23(7):1090-1098. doi:10.1016/j.joca.2015.03.034.			x		

Citation	Outcome	Population	Study Design	Exposure	Other
Hunter DJ, Beavers DP, Eckstein F, et al. The intensive diet and exercise for arthritis trial (IDEA): 18-month radiographic and MRI outcomes. <i>Arthritis</i> <i>Rheum</i> . 2012;64:S1070.			x		
Jegu AG, Pereira B, Andant N, Coudeyre E. Effect of eccentric isokinetic strengthening in the rehabilitation of patients with knee osteoarthritis: Isogo, a randomized trial. <i>Trials</i> . April 2014;15:106. doi:10.1186/1745-6215-15-106.	х				
Kean CO, Hinman RS, Wrigley TV, Lim BW, Bennell KL. Impact loading following quadriceps strength training in individuals with medial knee osteoarthritis and varus alignment. <i>Clin Biomech</i> <i>(Bristol, Avon).</i> Feb 2017;42:20-24. doi:10.1016/j.clinbiomech.2017.01.002.				х	
Kou U, Tohyama H, Chiba T, Ikoma K, Yasuda K. Long-term effects of video-based home exercise on clinical and radiographic outcomes in subject with knee osteoarthritis: a two-year randomized controlled trial. <i>Osteoarthritis Cartilage</i> . April 2013;21:S40. doi:10.1016/j.joca.2013.02.102.					х
Landsmeer ML, Runhaar J, van der Plas P, et al. Reducing progression of knee OA features assessed by MRI in overweight and obese women: secondary outcomes of a preventive RCT. <i>Osteoarthritis</i> <i>Cartilage</i> . 2016;24(6):982-990. doi:10.1016/j.joca.2015.12.016.				х	
Lange AK, Vanwanseele B, Foroughi N, et al. Resistive Exercise for Arthritic Cartilage Health (REACH): a randomized double-blind, sham-exercise controlled trial. <i>BMC Geriatr</i> . Jan 2009;9:1. doi:10.1186/1471-2318-9-1.			x		
Li LC, Lineker S, Cibere J, et al. Capitalizing on the teachable moment: osteoarthritis physical activity and exercise net for improving physical activity in early knee osteoarthritis. <i>JMIR Res Protoc</i> . 2013;2(1):e17. doi:10.2196/resprot.2553.			х		
Mikesky AE, Mazzuca SA, Brandt KD, Perkins SM, Damush T, Lane KA. Effects of strength training on the incidence and progression of knee osteoarthritis. <i>Arthritis Rheum</i> . 2006;55(5):690-699. doi:10.1002/art.22245.					х
Miller RH, Edwards WB, Brandon SC, Morton AM, Deluzio KJ. Why don't most runners get knee osteoarthritis? A case for per-unit-distance loads. <i>Med Sci Sports Exerc</i> . 2014;46(3):572-579. doi:10.1249/MSS.000000000000135.				Х	
Miyazaki T, Uchida K, Sato M, et al. Knee laxity after staircase exercise predicts radiographic disease progression in medial compartment knee osteoarthritis. <i>Arthritis Rheum</i> . 2012;64(12):3908- 3916. doi:10.1002/art.34662.			x		

Citation	Outcome	Population	Study Design	Exposure	Other
Multanen J, Hakkinen A, Kujala U, et al. The effects of bone exercise on knee pain, stiffness and function among women with mild knee osteoarthritis: randomized, controlled trial. <i>Physiotherapy (United</i> <i>Kingdom)</i> . 2011;97:eS852-eS853.	х				
Neogi DS, Kumar A, Rijal L, Yadav CS, Jaiman A, Nag HL. Role of nonoperative treatment in managing degenerative tears of the medial meniscus posterior root. <i>J Orthop Traumatol</i> . 2013;14(3):193-199. doi:10.1007/s10195-013-0234-2.			х		
Ng NT, Heesch KC, Brown WJ. Efficacy of a progressive walking program and glucosamine sulphate supplementation on osteoarthritic symptoms of the hip and knee: a feasibility trial. <i>Arthritis Res Ther</i> . 2010;12(1):R25. doi:10.1186/ar2932.				х	
O'Hanlon MS, Siddiqi Q, Allen SL, Edwards KL. A randomised controlled trial to investigate walking 6,000 steps per day on pain and function in knee osteoarthritis progression: the walkout study. <i>Osteoarthritis Cartilage</i> . 2016;24:S486. doi:10.1016/j.joca.2016.01.891.				х	
Øiestad BE, White DK, Booton R, et al. Longitudinal course of physical function in people with symptomatic knee osteoarthritis: data from the Multicenter Osteoarthritis Study and the Osteoarthritis Initiative. <i>Arthritis Care Res</i> <i>(Hoboken).</i> 2016;68(3):325-331. doi:10.1002/acr.22674.				Х	
Pisters MF, Veenhof C, van Dijk GM, Dekker J, CARPA Study Group. Avoidance of activity and limitations in activities in patients with osteoarthritis of the hip or knee: a 5 year follow-up study on the mediating role of reduced muscle strength. <i>Osteoarthritis Cartilage</i> . 2014;22(2):171- 177. doi:10.1016/j.joca.2013.12.007.				x	
Quicke JG, Foster NE, Thomas MJ, Holden MA. Is long-term physical activity safe for older adults with knee pain? A systematic review. <i>Osteoarthritis</i> <i>Cartilage</i> . 2015;23(9):1445-56. doi:10.1016/j.joca.2015.05.002.					Х
Rewald S, Mesters I, Emans PJ, Arts JJ, Lenssen AF, de Bie RA. Aquatic circuit training including aqua- cycling in patients with knee osteoarthritis: a feasibility study. <i>J Rehabil Med</i> . 2015;47(4):376-381. doi:10.2340/16501977-1937.	Х				
Salli A, Sahin N, Baskent A, Ugurlu H. The effect of two exercise programs on various functional outcome measures in patients with osteoarthritis of the knee: a randomized controlled clinical trial. <i>Isokinet Exerc Sci.</i> 2010;18(4):201-209. doi:10.3233/IES-2010-0385.	х				

Citation	Outcome	Population	Study Design	Exposure	Other
Song J, Semanik P, Sharma L, et al. Assessing physical activity in persons with knee osteoarthritis using accelerometers: data from the osteoarthritis initiative. <i>Arthritis Care Res (Hoboken)</i> . 2010;62(12):1724-1732. doi:10.1002/acr.20305.	х				
Srivastava RN, Avasthi V, Srivastava SR, Raj S. Does yoga improve pain, stiffness and physical disability in knee osteoarthritis? A randomize controlled clinical trial. <i>Osteoarthritis Cartilage</i> . April 2015;23:A167. doi:10.1016/j.joca.2015.02.930.				x	
Stensrud S, Roos EM, Risberg MA. A 12-week exercise therapy program in middle-aged patients with degenerative meniscus tears: a case series with 1-year follow-up. <i>J Orthop Sports Phys Ther</i> . 2012;42(11):919-931. doi:10.2519/jospt.2012.4165				х	
Tateuchi H, Koyama Y, Akiyama H, et al. Daily cumulative hip moment is associated with radiographic progression of secondary hip osteoarthritis. <i>Osteoarthritis Cartilage</i> . 2017;25(8):1291-1298. doi:10.1016/j.joca.2017.02.796.				x	
Thorp LE, Wimmer MA, Foucher KC, Sumner DR, Shakoor N, Block JA. The biomechanical effects of focused muscle training on medial knee loads in OA of the knee: a pilot, proof of concept study. J <i>Musculoskelet Neuronal Interact</i> . 2010;10(2):166- 173.	х				
Tohyama H, Chiba T, Kou U, et al. Effects of video- based home exercise on clinical and radiographic outcomes in adults with knee osteoarthritis: a one- year randomized controlled trial. <i>Osteoarthritis</i> <i>Cartilage.</i> Sept 2011;19:S37. doi:10.1016/S1063- 4584(11)60095-2.					x
Torry MR. Scientific and clinical advances leading to improved treatment of knee osteoarthritis. <i>Med Sci Sports Exerc</i> . 2008;40(2):191-192. doi:10.1249/mss.0b013e31815cb1eb.			Х		
Uusi-Rasi K, Patil R, Karinkanta S, Tokola K, Kannus P, Sievänen H. Exercise training in treatment and rehabilitation of hip osteoarthritis: a 12-week pilot trial. <i>J Osteoporos</i> . Jan 2017:3905492. doi:10.1155/2017/3905492.			х		
Videman T, Battié MC, Ripatti S, Gill K, Manninen H, Kaprio J. Determinants of the progression in lumbar degeneration: a 5-year follow-up study of adult male monozygotic twins. <i>Spine (Phila Pa 1976)</i> . 2006;31(6):671-678. doi:10.1097/01.brs.0000202558.86309.ea.				х	
Vincent KR, Hamilton AS, Lomonaco C, et al. Poster 202 Progressive enhanced eccentric or concentric resistance exercise training for knee osteoarthritis: initial results on pain and function. <i>PM R</i> . 2012;4(10)(suppl):S188. doi:10.1016/j.pmrj.2012.09.629.	x				

Citation	Outcome	Population	Study Design	Exposure	Other
Vincent KR, Montero C, Vincent HK. Progressive enhanced eccentric or concentric resistance exercise training for knee osteoarthritis. <i>Osteoarthritis Cartilage</i> . 2013;21:S275-S276. doi:10.1016/j.joca.2013.02.577.	х				
Walter JP, D'Lima DD, Colwell CW Jr, Fregly BJ. Decreased knee adduction moment does not guarantee decreased medial contact force during gait. <i>J Orthop Res</i> . 2010;28(10):1348-1354. doi:10.1002/jor.21142.				х	
White DK, Zhang Y, Niu J, et al. Do worsening knee radiographs mean greater chances of severe functional limitation? <i>Arthritis Care Res (Hoboken)</i> . 2010;62(10):1433-1439. doi:10.1002/acr.20247.				х	
Wondrasch B, Aroen A, Rotterud JH, Hoysveen T, Bolstad K, Risberg MA. The feasibility of a 3-month active rehabilitation program for patients with knee full-thickness articular cartilage lesions: the Oslo Cartilage Active Rehabilitation and Education Study. <i>J Orthop Sports Phys Ther</i> . 2013;43(5):310-324. doi:10.2519/jospt.2013.4354.				Х	
Yusuf E. Pharmacologic and non-pharmacologic treatment of osteoarthritis. <i>Curr Treatm Opt Rheumatol.</i> 2016;2(2):111-125.			х		
Zeni JA Jr, Higginson JS. Dynamic knee joint stiffness in subjects with a progressive increase in severity of knee osteoarthritis. <i>Clin Biomech (Bristol, Avon)</i> . 2009;24(4):366-371. doi:10.1016/j.clinbiomech.2009.01.005.	х				

References

1. Bartels EM, Juhl CB, Christensen R, et al. Aquatic exercise for the treatment of knee and hip osteoarthritis. *Cochrane Database Syst Rev.* 2016;Cd005523. doi:10.1002/14651858.CD005523.pub3.

2. Beumer L, Wong J, Warden SJ, Kemp JL, Foster P, Crossley KM. Effects of exercise and manual therapy on pain associated with hip osteoarthritis: a systematic review and meta-analysis. *Br J Sports Med*. 2016;50(8):458–463. doi:10.1136/bjsports-2015-095255.

3. Chang WD, Chen S, Lee CL, Lin HY, Lai PT. The effects of tai chi chuan on improving mind-body health for knee osteoarthritis patients: a systematic review and meta-analysis. *Evid Based Complement Alternat Med*. 2016;1813979. doi:10.1155/2016/1813979.

4. Fransen M, McConnell S, Harmer AR, Van der Esch M, Simic M, Bennell KL. Exercise for osteoarthritis of the knee: a Cochrane systematic review. *Br J Sports Med*. 2015;49(24):1554–1557. doi:10.1136/bjsports-2015-095424.

5. Juhl C, Christensen R, Roos EM, Zhang W, Lund H. Impact of exercise type and dose on pain and disability in knee osteoarthritis: a systematic review and meta-regression analysis of randomized controlled trials. *Arthritis Rheumatol.* 2014;66(3):622–636. doi:10.1002/art.38290.

6. Escalante Y, Garcia-Hermoso A, Saavedra JM. Effects of exercise on functional aerobic capacity in lower limb osteoarthritis: a systematic review. *J Sci Med Sport*. 2011;14(3):190–198. doi:10.1016/j.jsams.2010.10.004.

7. Quicke JG, Foster NE, Thomas MJ, Holden MA. Is long-term physical activity safe for older adults with knee pain? A systematic review. *Osteoarthritis Cartilage*. 2015;23(9):1445–1456. doi:10.1016/j.joca.2015.05.002.

8. Timmins KA, Leech RD, Batt ME, Edwards KL. Running and knee osteoarthritis: a systematic review and meta-analysis. *Am J Sports Med*. 2016;45(6):1447-1457. doi: 10.1177/0363546516657531.

9. Dore DA, Winzenberg TM, Ding C, et al. The association between objectively measured physical activity and knee structural change using MRI. *Ann Rheum Dis.* 2013;72(7):1170–1175. doi:10.1136/annrheumdis-2012-201691.

10. Felson DT, Niu J, Yang T, et al. Physical activity, alignment and knee osteoarthritis: data from MOST and the OAI. *Osteoarthritis Cartilage*. 2013;21(6):789–795. doi:10.1016/j.joca.2013.03.001.

11. Kwee RM, Wirth W, Hafezi-Nejad N, Zikria BA, Guermazi A, Demehri S. Role of physical activity in cartilage damage progression of subjects with baseline full-thickness cartilage defects in medial tibiofemoral compartment: data from the Osteoarthritis Initiative. *Osteoarthritis Cartilage*. 2016;24(11):1898–1904. doi:10.1016/j.joca.2016.06.009.

12. Lin W, Alizai H, Joseph GB, et al. Physical activity in relation to knee cartilage T2 progression measured with 3 T MRI over a period of 4 years: data from the Osteoarthritis Initiative. *Osteoarthritis Cartilage*. 2013;21(10):1558–1566. doi:10.1016/j.joca.2013.06.022.

13. Oiestad BE, Quinn E, White D, et al. No association between daily walking and knee structural changes in people at risk of or with mild knee osteoarthritis. Prospective data from the Multicenter Osteoarthritis Study. *J Rheumatol*. 2015;42(9):1685–1693. doi:10.3899/jrheum.150071.